



SCIENTIFIC COMMITTEE AND EMERGING RISKS UNIT

SCIENTIFIC COMMITTEE

MINUTES OF THE 16TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON "SCIENTIFIC CRITERIA FOR GROUPING CHEMICALS INTO ASSESSMENT GROUPS FOR HUMAN HEALTH RISK ASSESSMENT OF COMBINED EXPOSURE TO MULTIPLE CHEMICALS"

Held as a teleconference on 29th October 2021

"This meeting, originally scheduled as a physical meeting, was converted into a teleconference to avoid traveling to EFSA in line with the measures established to reduce the risk of coronavirus infection."

(Agreed on 17th November 2021)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Christer Hogstrand (Chair)
Emilio Benfenati
Amélie Crépet
Antonio Hernandez-Jerez
Suzanne Hougaard Bennekou
Kyriaki Machera
Jan Dirk te Biesebeek
Emanuela Testai
Josef Schlatter
- Hearing Experts¹:
Not Applicable

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
SCER Unit: Jean Lou Dorne (Chair and Secretariat)
DATA Unit: Bruno Dujardin

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion (EFSA-Q-2019-00517)

The members of the working group discussed the comments received on the guidance document from both the public consultation (May-July 2021) and the EFSA online international workshop on risk assessment of combined exposure to multiple chemicals (18-19-20 October 2021). The working group discussed all individual comments and EFSA's replies within the associated technical report for both PC and international workshop as well as the relevant changes in the guidance document. From all comments received, changes were proposed for chapter 3, chapter 4, the glossary and the Annex sections of the guidance document. The guidance document and technical report will be presented at the 106th Scientific Committee plenary for possible adoption.

5. Next meeting(s)

No further meetings are currently planned.

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



SCIENTIFIC COMMITTEE AND EMERGING RISKS UNIT

SCIENTIFIC COMMITTEE

MINUTES OF THE 15TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON "SCIENTIFIC CRITERIA FOR GROUPING CHEMICALS INTO ASSESSMENT GROUPS FOR HUMAN HEALTH RISK ASSESSMENT OF COMBINED EXPOSURE TO MULTIPLE CHEMICALS"

Held as a teleconference on 23rd April 2021

"This meeting, originally scheduled as a physical meeting, was converted into a teleconference to avoid traveling to EFSA in line with the measures established to reduce the risk of coronavirus infection."

(Agreed on 26th April 2021)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Christer Hogstrand
Susanne Hougaard Bennekou
Antonio Hernandez-Jerez
Kyriaki Machera
Josef Schlatter
- Hearing Experts¹:
Not Applicable
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

SCER Unit: Jean Lou Dorne (Chair and Secretariat)

DATA Unit: Bruno Dujardin

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion (EFSA-Q-2019-00517)

The members of the working group discussed the comments and proposals for minor changes from the last Scientific Committee (SC) plenary of the 15th April 2021 where the guidance was endorsed for public consultation. Further minor editorials were proposed for Chapter 3 and 4 and the Annex sections of the guidance document (GD). The guidance will be published for public consultation in May for period of 2 months.

5. Next meeting(s)

The next meeting will take place at the end of October 2021.

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



SCIENTIFIC COMMITTEE AND EMERGING RISKS UNIT

SCIENTIFIC COMMITTEE

MINUTES OF THE 14TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON "SCIENTIFIC CRITERIA FOR GROUPING CHEMICALS INTO ASSESSMENT GROUPS FOR HUMAN HEALTH RISK ASSESSMENT OF COMBINED EXPOSURE TO MULTIPLE CHEMICALS"

Held as a teleconference on 22nd February 2021

"This meeting, originally scheduled as a physical meeting, was converted into a teleconference to avoid traveling to EFSA in line with the measures established to reduce the risk of coronavirus infection."

(Agreed on 26th February 2021)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Christer Hogstrand
Antonio Hernandez-Jerez
Kyriaki Machera
Josef Schlatter
- Hearing Experts¹:
Not Applicable
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
SCER Unit: Jean Lou Dorne (Chair and Secretariat)
DATA Unit: Bruno Dujardin

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion (EFSA-Q-2019-00517)

The members of the working group discussed the comments and proposals for change from the last Scientific Committee (SC) plenary of the 18th February 2021. Further editorials were proposed for Chapter 4 and the Annex section of the guidance document (GD). An edited version of the GD will be circulated to SC members who had provided comments prior to submission for endorsement for public consultation at the next SC plenary (14th-15th April 2021).

5. Next meeting(s)

The next meeting will take place on the 23rd April 2021.

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



SCIENTIFIC COMMITTEE AND EMERGING RISKS UNIT

SCIENTIFIC COMMITTEE

MINUTES OF THE 13TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON "SCIENTIFIC CRITERIA FOR GROUPING CHEMICALS INTO ASSESSMENT GROUPS FOR HUMAN HEALTH RISK ASSESSMENT OF COMBINED EXPOSURE TO MULTIPLE CHEMICALS"

Held as a teleconference on 9th December 2020

"This meeting, originally scheduled as a physical meeting, was converted into a teleconference to avoid traveling to EFSA in line with the measures established to reduce the risk of coronavirus infection."

(Agreed on 16th December 2020)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Christer Hogstrand (Chair)
Emilio Benfenati
Amélie Crépet
Antonio Hernandez-Jerez
Kyriaki Machera
Jan Dirk te Biesebeek
Emanuela Testai
Josef Schlatter

- Hearing Experts¹:
Not Applicable

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
SCER Unit: Jean Lou Dorne (Secretariat)
DATA Unit: Bruno Dujardin

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies for absence were sent by Susanne Hougaard-Bennekou.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion (EFSA-Q-2019-00517)

The members of the working group discussed the comments and proposals for change from the last Scientific Committee plenary of the 12th November, and the working group meetings of the 13th and 25th November. Further editorials were proposed for Chapter 3 and Chapter 4. It was agreed to address the remaining comments prior to submission to the Scientific Committee for the next plenary (17th-18th February 2021).

5. Next meeting(s)

The next meeting with a drafting WG will take place on the 22nd February 2021.

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



SCIENTIFIC COMMITTEE AND EMERGING RISKS UNIT

SCIENTIFIC COMMITTEE

MINUTES OF THE 12TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON "SCIENTIFIC CRITERIA FOR GROUPING CHEMICALS INTO ASSESSMENT GROUPS FOR HUMAN HEALTH RISK ASSESSMENT OF COMBINED EXPOSURE TO MULTIPLE CHEMICALS"

Held as a teleconference on 25th November 2020

"This meeting, originally scheduled as a physical meeting, was converted into a teleconference to avoid traveling to EFSA in line with the measures established to reduce the risk of coronavirus infection."

(Agreed on 1st December 2020)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Josef Schlatter
Emanuela Testai
- Hearing Experts¹:
Not Applicable
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
SCER Unit: Jean Lou Dorne (Secretariat and Chair)

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion (EFSA-Q-2019-00517)

The members of the working group discussed the comments and proposals for change from the last working group meeting of the 13th November. Further minor editorials were proposed for Chapter 3 and Chapter 4. It was agreed to address the remaining comments at the next working group meeting with the whole working group (9th December 2020) prior to submission to the Scientific Committee for the next Plenary (17th-18th February 2021).

5. Next meeting(s)

The next meeting with a drafting WG will take place on the 9th December 2020.

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



SCIENTIFIC COMMITTEE AND EMERGING RISKS UNIT

SCIENTIFIC COMMITTEE

MINUTES OF THE 11TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON "SCIENTIFIC CRITERIA FOR GROUPING CHEMICALS INTO ASSESSMENT GROUPS FOR HUMAN HEALTH RISK ASSESSMENT OF COMBINED EXPOSURE TO MULTIPLE CHEMICALS"

Held as a teleconference on 13th November 2020

"This meeting, originally scheduled as a physical meeting, was converted into a teleconference to avoid traveling to EFSA in line with the measures established to reduce the risk of coronavirus infection."

(Agreed on 24th November 2020)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Christer Hogstrand
Antonio Hernandez-Jerez
Suzanne Hougaard Bennekou
Kyriaki Machera
- Hearing Experts¹:
Not Applicable
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
SCER Unit: Jean Lou Dorne (Secretariat and Chair)
DATA Unit: Bruno Dujardin

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion (EFSA-Q-2019-00517)

The working group discussed the comments received from the Scientific Committee (SC) at the Plenary of the 12th November 2020. It was agreed to address the focus on the comments on chapter 4 dealing with prioritisation methods (exposure-driven and risk-based prioritisation methods). Further amendments were proposed to clarify the text in this chapter. The working group discussed the need for further refinements of the document prior to its submission to the next meetings (25th November and 9th December 2020) and for the next Scientific Committee Plenary (17th-18th February 2021).

5. Next meeting(s)

The next meeting with a drafting WG will take place on the 25th November 2020.

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



SCIENTIFIC COMMITTEE AND EMERGING RISKS UNIT

SCIENTIFIC COMMITTEE

MINUTES OF THE 10TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON "SCIENTIFIC CRITERIA FOR GROUPING CHEMICALS INTO ASSESSMENT GROUPS FOR HUMAN HEALTH RISK ASSESSMENT OF COMBINED EXPOSURE TO MULTIPLE CHEMICALS"

Held as a teleconference on 6th and 7th October 2020

"This meeting, originally scheduled as a physical meeting, was converted into a teleconference to avoid traveling to EFSA in line with the measures established to reduce the risk of coronavirus infection."

(Agreed on 19th October 2020)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
 - Christer Hogstrand (Chair)
 - Emilio Benfenati
 - Amélie Crépet
 - Antonio Hernandez-Jerez
 - Suzanne Hougaard Bennekou
 - Kyriaki Machera
 - Jan Dirk te Biesebeek
 - Emanuela Testai
 - Josef Schlatter
- Hearing Experts¹:
 - Not Applicable

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
SCER Unit: Jean Lou Dorne (Secretariat)
DATA Unit: Bruno Dujardin
FEEDAP Unit: Paola Manini

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies for absence were sent by Emanuela Testai for the 6th and 7th October 2020 and Josef Schlatter and Suzanne Hougaard Bennekou for the 7th October 2020.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion (EFSA-Q-2019-00517)

The working group discussed the comments received from the Scientific Committee at the Plenary of the 17th September 2020. It was agreed to reduce the section on problem formulation and contextualise the prioritisation methods. The discussion then mostly focused on chapter 4 on prioritisation methods (exposure-driven and risk-based prioritisation methods) with proposals to modify the figure. Further amendments were also proposed to clarify the text for this chapter and introduce another case study in the annex for the use of combined risk metrics. The working group discussed the need for further refinements of the document prior to its submission to the Scientific Committee (SC) (30st October 2020) for the next plenary (11th-12th November 2020).

5. Next meeting(s)

The next meeting with a drafting WG will take place on the 13th November 2020.

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



SCIENTIFIC COMMITTEE AND EMERGING RISKS UNIT

SCIENTIFIC COMMITTEE

MINUTES OF THE 9TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON "SCIENTIFIC CRITERIA FOR GROUPING CHEMICALS INTO ASSESSMENT GROUPS FOR HUMAN HEALTH RISK ASSESSMENT OF COMBINED EXPOSURE TO MULTIPLE CHEMICALS"

Held as a teleconference on 27th July 2020

"This meeting, originally scheduled as a physical meeting, was converted into a teleconference to avoid traveling to EFSA in line with the measures established to reduce the risk of coronavirus infection."

(Agreed on 14th August 2020)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
 - Christer Hogstrand (Chair)
 - Emilio Benfenati
 - Amélie Crépet
 - Antonio Hernandez-Jerez
 - Suzanne Hougaard Bennekou
 - Kyriaki Machera
 - Jan Dirk te Biesebeek
 - Emanuela Testai
 - Josef Schlatter
- Hearing Experts¹:
 - Not Applicable

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
SCER Unit: Jean Lou Dorne (Secretariat)
DATA Unit: Bruno Dujardin
PRES Unit: Luc Mohimont
FEEDAP Unit: Paola Manini

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies for absence were sent by Diane Benford.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion (EFSA-Q-2019-00517)

The working group discussed the document chapter by chapter starting with chapter 1 (introduction) and chapter 2 (general principles: problem formulation and grouping) for which all comments were addressed. The discussion followed with chapter 3 on hazard driven criteria and chapter 4 on prioritisation methods (exposure-driven and risk-based prioritisation methods). Further amendments were proposed to clarify the text for both chapters. The working group discussed the need for further refinements of the document prior to its submission to the Scientific Committee (SC) (1st September 2020) for a first read at the next plenary (16th -17th September 2020).

5. Next meeting(s)

The next meeting of the WG will take place as a conference call on the 6th-7th October 2020.

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



SCIENTIFIC COMMITTEE AND EMERGING RISKS UNIT

SCIENTIFIC COMMITTEE

MINUTES OF THE 8TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON "SCIENTIFIC CRITERIA FOR GROUPING CHEMICALS INTO ASSESSMENT GROUPS FOR HUMAN HEALTH RISK ASSESSMENT OF COMBINED EXPOSURE TO MULTIPLE CHEMICALS"

Held as a teleconference on 30th June 2020

"This meeting, originally scheduled as a physical meeting, was converted into a teleconference to avoid traveling to EFSA in line with the measures established to reduce the risk of coronavirus infection."

(Agreed on 10th July 2020)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
 - Christer Hogstrand (Chair)
 - Emilio Benfenati
 - Amélie Crépet
 - Antonio Hernandez-Jerez
 - Suzanne Hougaard Bennekou
 - Kyriaki Machera
 - Jan Dirk te Biesebeek
 - Emanuela Testai
 - Josef Schlatter
- Hearing Experts¹:
 - Not Applicable

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
SCER Unit: Jean Lou Dorne (Secretariat)
DATA Unit: Bruno Dujardin
PRES Unit: Luc Mohimont
FEEDAP Unit: Paola Manini

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies for absence were sent by Diane Benford.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion (EFSA-Q-2019-00517)

The working group first discussed examples in the annex illustrating the use of exposure-driven and risk-based prioritisation methods for pesticides and for the monitoring of biological media (i.e. human milk). It was proposed to provide a table summarising the outcome of the exercise for each example using a modified form of the table from the MIXTOX guidance document. The text of the document regarding the prioritisation tools was then discussed together with the general scheme with some comments. Further amendments were proposed to clarify the figure particularly to provide a clear link with the outcome of the grouping of chemicals using hazard-driven criteria. The working group then discussed comments on the introduction, background, problem formulation section and hazard-driven criteria with some comments. It was proposed to produce a clean document for the next meeting after considering all comments from the working group members.

5. Next meeting(s)

The next meeting of the WG will take place as a conference call on the 27th July 2020.

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



SCIENTIFIC COMMITTEE AND EMERGING RISKS UNIT

SCIENTIFIC COMMITTEE

MINUTES OF THE 7TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON "SCIENTIFIC CRITERIA FOR GROUPING CHEMICALS INTO ASSESSMENT GROUPS FOR HUMAN HEALTH RISK ASSESSMENT OF COMBINED EXPOSURE TO MULTIPLE CHEMICALS"

Held as a teleconference on 14th May 2020

"This meeting, originally scheduled as a physical meeting, was converted into a teleconference to avoid traveling to EFSA in line with the measures established to reduce the risk of coronavirus infection."

(Agreed on 29th May 2020)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
 - Christer Hogstrand
 - Emilio Benfenati
 - Amélie Crépet
 - Diane Benford
 - Antonio Hernandez-Jerez
 - Suzanne Hougaard Bennekou
 - Kyriaki Machera
 - Jan Dirk te Biesebeek
 - Emanuela Testai
 - Josef Schlatter
- Hearing Experts¹:
 - Not Applicable

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
SCER Unit: Jean Lou Dorne (Secretariat and Chair)
DATA Unit: Bruno Dujardin
PRES Unit: Luc Mohimont
FEEDAP Unit: Paola Manini

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion (EFSA-Q-2019-00517)

The working group first discussed the figure on prioritisation tools (exposure-driven and risk-based criteria) and further amendments were proposed to clarify the figure. The working group proposed to also finalise the text in the document to describe the figure for the next meeting. The working group then discussed comments on the introduction, background and problem formulation section with some comments. A discussion on the chapter on hazard-driven criteria followed and all figures were agreed including the modified figure on AOP networks and the general framework. The Working group then discussed the weight of evidence approach and the summary table to be finalised and agreed to produce an excel spreadsheet to support users for practical applications. The short section on the use of toxicokinetic data for grouping was discussed and common metabolites were agreed as a potential option for grouping in some specific contexts including contaminants. The use of the hazard index approach using risk-based criteria to prioritise the grouping of pesticides into assessment groups was briefly discussed as a practical example to be finalised for the next meeting.

5. Next meeting(s)

The next meeting of the WG will take place as a conference call on the 30th June 2020.

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



SCIENTIFIC COMMITTEE AND EMERGING RISKS UNIT

SCIENTIFIC COMMITTEE

MINUTES OF THE 6TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON "SCIENTIFIC CRITERIA FOR GROUPING CHEMICALS INTO ASSESSMENT GROUPS FOR HUMAN HEALTH RISK ASSESSMENT OF COMBINED EXPOSURE TO MULTIPLE CHEMICALS"

Held as a teleconference on 23rd-24th April 2020

"This meeting, originally scheduled as a physical meeting, was converted into a teleconference to avoid traveling to EFSA in line with the measures established to reduce the risk of coronavirus infection."

(Agreed on 8th May 2020)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Christer Hogstrand (Chair)
Emilio Benfenati
Amélie Crépet
Diane Benford
Antonio Hernandez-Jerez
Suzanne Hougaard Bennekou
Kyriaki Machera
Jan Dirk te Biesebeek
Emanuela Testai
Josef Schlatter
- Hearing Experts¹:
Not Applicable

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:
SCER Unit: Jean Lou Dorne (Secretariat)
DATA Unit: Bruno Dujardin
PRES Unit: Luc Mohimont
FEEDAP Unit: Paola Manini

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion (EFSA-Q-2019-00517)

The working group discussed individual schemes proposed for the draft document on grouping chemicals into assessment groups when applying component-based approaches. The working group first discussed the updated figure for problem formulation providing a general framework for the document. The Working group then discussed the figures related to the hazard-driven criteria including figures depicting 1. the difference between mode of action and adverse outcome pathway (AOP), 2. AOP networks, 3. The general framework for the hazard-driven criteria. All figures were agreed amongst the working group members. The Working group then discussed the proposed figure on prioritisation tools (exposure-driven and risk-based criteria) and amendments were proposed to clarify the figure. Finally, figures dealing with the use of toxicokinetic data and information on interactions were also discussed and the working group concluded that this information would be replaced by text in the opinion. Proposals to introduce practical examples in the document were also briefly discussed.

5. Next meeting(s)

The next meeting of the WG will take place as a conference call on the 14th May 2020.

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



SCIENTIFIC COMMITTEE AND EMERGING RISKS UNIT

SCIENTIFIC COMMITTEE

MINUTES OF THE 5TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON "SCIENTIFIC CRITERIA FOR GROUPING CHEMICALS INTO ASSESSMENT GROUPS FOR HUMAN HEALTH RISK ASSESSMENT OF COMBINED EXPOSURE TO MULTIPLE CHEMICALS"

Held as a teleconference on 9th March 2020

(Agreed on 16th March 2020)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Christer Hogstrand (Chair)
Emilio Benfenati
Amélie Crépet
Antonio Hernandez-Jerez
Suzanne Hougaard Bennekou
Kyriaki Machera
Jan Dirk te Biesebeek
Emanuela Testai
Josef Schlatter
- Hearing Experts¹:
Not Applicable
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

SCER Unit: Jean Lou Dorne (Secretariat)

DATA Unit: Bruno Dujardin

PRES Unit: Luc Mohimont

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies for absence were sent by Diane Benford.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion (EFSA-Q-2019-00517)

The working group discussed individual contributions to the draft document throughout the meeting. The working group first discussed the updated problem formulation section in the context of grouping chemicals into assessment groups when applying component-based approaches as well as regulatory and science -based criteria (hazard-driven criteria and prioritisation methods including exposure-driven and risk-based criteria). In addition, the general introductory scheme for the problem formulation section was discussed in relation to applying such criteria and proposals for further refinements were formulated. A discussion followed on the general approach for grouping chemicals into assessment groups using hazard-driven criteria in relation to mode of action, adverse outcome pathways, phenomenological effects and systemic toxicity data particularly while applying weight of evidence approaches. Proposals to introduce practical examples in the document were also discussed.

5. Next meeting(s)

The next meeting of the WG will take place as a physical meeting or conference call on the 23rd and 24th April 2020.

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



SCIENTIFIC COMMITTEE AND EMERGING RISKS UNIT

SCIENTIFIC COMMITTEE

MINUTES OF THE 4TH MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON "SCIENTIFIC CRITERIA FOR GROUPING CHEMICALS INTO ASSESSMENT GROUPS FOR HUMAN HEALTH RISK ASSESSMENT OF COMBINED EXPOSURE TO MULTIPLE CHEMICALS"

Held in Parma on 6-7 February 2020

(Agreed on 18th February 2020)

Participants

- Working Group Members:
Christer Hogstrand (Chair)
Emilio Benfenati
Diane Benford (by Teleconference)
Amélie Crépet
Antonio Hernandez-Jerez
Suzanne Hougaard Bennekou
Kyriaki Machera
Jan Dirk te Biesebeek
Josef Schlatter
- Hearing Experts¹:
Not Applicable
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
- EFSA:

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

SCER Unit: Jean Lou Dorne (Secretariat)

DATA Unit: Bruno Dujardin

PRES Unit: Luc Mohimont

FEEDAP Unit: Paola Manini

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies for absence were sent by Emanuela Testai.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion (EFSA-Q-2019-00517)

The working group discussed, throughout the meeting, individual contributions to the draft scientific opinion. During the first day (6th February), the working group discussed the interpretation of the terms of reference for the grouping of chemicals into assessment groups when applying component-based approaches. Hazard-driven criteria were then discussed in relation to weight of evidence approaches for grouping and available hazard data ranging from systemic toxicity, to target organ toxicity to mode of action and adverse outcome pathways. Particular emphasis was given to the consideration of mechanistic data for the grouping of chemicals when available. On the second day (7th February), the working group discussed approaches and potential practical frameworks to consider exposure-driven criteria and risk-based criteria as well as prioritisation tools.

5. Next meeting(s)

The next meeting of the WG will take place as a conference call on the 9th March 2020.

² http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

³ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



SCIENTIFIC COMMITTEE AND EMERGING RISKS UNIT

SCIENTIFIC COMMITTEE

MINUTES OF THE 3rd MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON "SCIENTIFIC CRITERIA FOR GROUPING CHEMICALS INTO ASSESSMENT GROUPS FOR HUMAN HEALTH RISK ASSESSMENT OF COMBINED EXPOSURE TO MULTIPLE CHEMICALS"

Held as a Teleconference on 14th January 2020

(Agreed on 31st January 2020)¹

Participants

■ Working Group Members:²

Christer Hogstrand (Chair)

Emilio Benfenati

Amélie Crépet

Antonio Hernandez-Jerez

Suzanne Hougaard Bennekou

Kyriaki Machera

Jan Dirk te Biesebeek

Diane Benford

Joseph Schlatter

■ Hearing Experts³:

Not Applicable

■ European Commission and/or Member States representatives:

Not Applicable

■ EFSA:

³ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies for absence were sent by Emanuela Testai.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence⁴ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management⁵, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion (EFSA-Q-2019-00517)

Contributions for the draft scientific opinion on "Scientific criteria for grouping chemicals into assessment groups for human risk assessment of combined exposure to multiple chemicals" were presented by each member to the working group. This included interpretation of the terms of reference, problem formulation, exposure criteria, hazard criteria and use of the weight of evidence particularly for toxicological effects including mechanistic data.

5. Next meeting(s)

The next meeting of the WG will take place on the 6th-7^h February 2020 as a physical meeting.

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/policy_independence.pdf

⁵ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/sites/default/files/corporate_publications/files/competing_interest_management_17.pdf



SCIENTIFIC COMMITTEE AND EMERGING RISKS UNIT

SCIENTIFIC COMMITTEE

MINUTES OF THE 2nd MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON "SCIENTIFIC CRITERIA FOR GROUPING CHEMICALS INTO ASSESSMENT GROUPS FOR HUMAN HEALTH RISK ASSESSMENT OF COMBINED EXPOSURE TO MULTIPLE CHEMICALS"

Held as a Teleconference on 18th November 2019

(Agreed on 5th December 2019)¹

Participants

- Working Group Members:²
Christer Hogstrand (chair)
Emilio Benfenati
Amélie Crépet
Antonio Hernandez-Jerez
Suzanne Hougaard Bennekou
Kyriaki Machera
Jan Dirk te Biesebeek
- Hearing Experts³:
Not Applicable
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
Not Applicable
Not Applicable
- EFSA:

¹ Minutes should be published within 15 working days of the final day of the relevant meeting.

² Indicate first full name and then surname (John Smith) all throughout the document.

³ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

SCER Unit : Jean Lou Dorne (Secretariat)

DATA Unit : Bruno Dujardin

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies for absence were sent by Diane Benford and Joseph Schlatter.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion (EFSA-Q-2019-00517)

Contributions for the draft scientific opinion on "Scientific criteria for grouping chemicals into assessment groups for human risk assessment of combined exposure to multiple chemicals" were presented by each member to the working group. This included interpretation of the terms of reference, problem formulation, use of the weight of evidence in applying the scientific criteria, exposure criteria, hazard criteria and risk criteria for different applications (prioritisation, urgent assessment, risk assessment of multiple chemicals as regulated products or contaminants).

5. Next meeting(s)

The next meeting of the WG will take place on the 14th January 2020 as a teleconference.



SCIENTIFIC COMMITTEE AND EMERGING RISKS UNIT

SCIENTIFIC COMMITTEE

MINUTES OF THE 1ST MEETING OF THE WORKING GROUP ON "SCIENTIFIC CRITERIA FOR GROUPING CHEMICALS INTO ASSESSMENT GROUPS FOR HUMAN HEALTH RISK ASSESSMENT OF COMBINED EXPOSURE TO MULTIPLE CHEMICALS"

Held on 01-02 October 2019, Parma

(Agreed on 15 October 2019)¹

Participants

- Working Group Members:²
 - Christer Hogstrand (chair)
 - Emilio Benfenati
 - Diane Benford via teleconference
 - Amélie Crépet
 - Antonio Hernandez-Jerez
 - Suzanne Hougaard Bennekou
 - Kyriaki Machera
 - Jan Dirk te Biesebeek
 - Josef Schlatter via teleconference
- Hearing Experts³:
 - Not Applicable
- European Commission and/or Member States representatives:
 - Not Applicable

¹ Minutes should be published within 15 working days of the final day of the relevant meeting.

² Indicate first full name and then surname (John Smith) all throughout the document.

³ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director concerning the selection of members of the Scientific Committee, the Scientific Panels, and the selection of external experts to assist EFSA with its scientific work:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

Not Applicable

■ EFSA:

SCER Unit : Jean Lou Dorne (Secretariat)

DATA Unit : Bruno Dujardin

CONTAM Unit : Hans Steinkellner (1 October)

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies for absence were sent by Emanuela Testai.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and the Decision of the Executive Director on Competing Interest Management, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest filled out by the Working Group members invited to the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process, and no interests were declared orally by the members at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topics for discussion (EFSA-Q-2019-00517)

Background to the previous MIXTOX working group of the scientific committee, lessons learnt and current terms of reference for the self-tasking mandate to produce a scientific opinion on "Scientific criteria for grouping chemicals into assessment groups for human risk assessment of combined exposure to multiple chemicals" was presented to the working group by the secretariat (Jean Lou Dorne). Self-tasking mandate proposed by the Scientific Committee.

A first draft of the scientific opinion was discussed with regards to scientific criteria for grouping chemicals in assessment groups for human risk assessment of combined exposure to multiple chemicals namely exposure criteria, hazard criteria and risk criteria for different applications (prioritisation, urgent assessment, risk assessment of multiple chemicals as regulated products or contaminants).

5. Next meeting(s)

The next meeting of the WG will be a teleconference on 18th November 2019.