
Scientific Committee and Emerging Risks (SCER) UNIT

Scientific Committee

Minutes of the 44th meeting of the Working Group on overarching elements of environmental risk assessment

Teleconference

Held on 5 April 2016 in Parma (Italy)

(Agreed on 5th April 2016)

Participants

- **Working Group Members**
 - Theo Brock (Chair), Robert Luttik, Tony Hardy, Joerg Romeis, Joe Perry, Wopke van der Werf.
- **Hearing Experts¹:**
 - Not Applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not Applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - SCER Unit: Angelo Maggiore, Reinhilde Schoonjans
- **Others**
 - Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Christer Hogstrand.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest³, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group member invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting were identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic for discussion

4.1 Protection Goals ([EFSA-Q-2013-00289](#))

The working group (WG) discussed, and improved where necessary, all remaining amendments proposed in the document, in particular those to address the comments provided by the colleagues of DG SANTE. These amendments occurred mainly in the following sections: 1.3 (Aim of the Guidance) aiming at clarifying the purpose of the document and the respective role of risk managers and risk assessors; the new section 1.7 (Biodiversity in an agricultural context) pointing out that the proposed framework is applicable to all potential stressors within EFSA's remit, also in non-pristine environments in which biodiversity is impacted by anthropogenic activities, and the role played by biodiversity in an agricultural context; appendix A (Examples of how SPUs and their five dimensions can be used to define SPG options in problem formulation) explaining how possible SPG options can be proposed by risk assessors of EFSA on the basis of the framework provided in the document.

The document is tabled for final adoption at the 78th plenary of the Scientific Committee (20-21 April 2016).

5. Any Other Business: none

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Scientific Committee and Emerging Risks (SCER) UNIT

Scientific Committee

Minutes of the 43rd meeting of the Working Group on overarching elements of environmental risk assessment

Teleconference

Held on 4 March 2016 in Parma (Italy)

(Agreed on 5th April 2016)

Participants

- **Working Group Members**
 - Theo Brock (Chair), Robert Luttik, Joerg Romeis, Joe Perry, Wopke van der Werf, Christer Hogstrand.
- **Hearing Experts¹:**
 - Not Applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not Applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - SCER Unit: Angelo Maggiore, Reinhilde Schoonjans
- **Others**
 - Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Tony Hardy.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest³, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group member invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting were identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic for discussion

4.1 Protection Goals ([EFSA-Q-2013-00289](#))

The working group (WG) addressed the comments received from the Commission, in particular in relation to the dialogue between risk managers and risk assessors when defining specific protection goals in the problem formulation phase of the environmental risk assessment. It was decided to expand section 1.3. of the document by explaining in greater detail the aim of the document, the respective role of risk managers and risk assessors, and the way the proposed framework is applicable to all potential stressors within EFSA's remit, also in non-pristine environments in which biodiversity is impacted by anthropogenic activities. It was also decided to describe in section 1.6 (or in a new section 1.7), in greater detail, the relation between biodiversity and ecosystem services in an agricultural context. In addition, it was decided that the provided SPG examples need a better introduction by explaining their aim and scope, which is the provision of possible SPG options by risk assessors of EFSA on the basis of the framework provided in the document and that may serve as starting point for the dialogue between risk assessors and risk managers. Several WG members suggested placing the SPG examples in an Appendix. The challenges and recommendations section was also discussed and amended.

5. Any Other Business: none

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Scientific Committee and Emerging Risks (SCER) UNIT

Scientific Committee

Minutes of the 42nd meeting of the Working Group on overarching elements of environmental risk assessment

Held on 14-15 January 2016 in Parma (Italy)

(Agreed on 4th March 2016)

Participants

- **Working Group Members**
 - Theo Brock (Chair), Robert Luttik, Joerg Romeis, Joe Perry, Tony Hardy, Wopke vander Werf, Christer Hogstrand
- **Hearing Experts¹:**
 - Not Applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not Applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - SCER Unit: Angelo Maggiore, Reinhilde Schoonjans
 - GMO Unit : Yann Devos
 - Pesticides Unit : Jose Tarazona
- **Others**
 - Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest and the Specific Declarations of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting were identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic for discussion

4.1 Protection Goals ([EFSA-Q-2013-00289](#))

The working group revised part of the draft Guidance, in particular addressing the sections related to step 1 (Identifying relevant ecosystem services for ERA), step 2 (Identifying relevant service providing units for relevant ecosystem services), step 3 (Specifying the level/parameters of protection), step 4 (Interdependency of the five dimensions) and section 3.5, dealing with examples of definition of specific protection goals for the different potential stressors that fall under the remit of EFSA. It was decided to add extra information to the GMO Laurel forest example to make clear that the introduction of cold-tolerant Eucalyptus is a potential realistic problem for Macaronesia and not merely a hypothetical exercise.

The conclusion and challenges sections were also discussed. It was decided to re-elaborate the challenges section by also introducing recommendations for each identified challenge. The document was considered ready for the reading and discussion at the forthcoming plenary of the Scientific Committee (17th February).

5. Any Other Business: none

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Scientific Committee and Emerging Risks (SCER) UNIT

Scientific Committee

Minutes of the 41st meeting of the Working Group on overarching elements of environmental risk assessment

Held on 18 December 2015 in Parma (Italy)

(Agreed on 14th January 2016)

Participants

- **Working Group Members**
 - Christer Hogstrand and in teleconnection: Theo Brock (Chair), Robert Luttik, Joerg Romeis, Joe Perry, Tony Hardy, Wopke vander Werf
- **Hearing Experts¹:**
 - Not Applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not Applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - SCER Unit: Angelo Maggiore
- **Others**
 - Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest and the Specific Declarations of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting were identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic for discussion

4.1 Protection Goals ([EFSA-Q-2013-00289](#))

The working group revised part of the draft Guidance, in particular the different options for the dimensions of the Service providing Unit.

Particular attention was given to clarifying the meaning of the magnitude of effects in the different fields under the remit of EFSA, taking into consideration biologically relevant and tolerable effects.

It was decided to change the position of the section on magnitude of effects in order to make it consistent with the approach followed in the EFSA PPR Panel (2010) opinion, though clarifying that magnitude of effects, temporal and spatial scale are assessed together.

The working group was requested to shorten the sections on the dimensions and to indicate all possible concerns related to the sections on conclusions and challenges before the next meeting, that will be held on 14-15th January 2016. The section on the examples will also be revisited, while the appendices will be eliminated.

5. Any Other Business: none

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Scientific Committee and Emerging Risks (SCER) UNIT

Scientific Committee

Minutes of the 40th meeting of the Working Group on overarching elements of environmental risk assessment

Held on 21 October 2015 in Parma (Italy)

(Agreed on 18 December 2015)

Participants

- **Working Group Members**
 - Theo Brock (Chair), Robert Luttik, Joerg Romeis, Joe Perry
- **Hearing Experts¹:**
 - Not Applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not Applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - SCER Unit: Angelo Maggiore
 - GMO Unit : Yann Devos
- **Others**
 - Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest and the Specific Declarations of Interest filled in by the working group member invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting were identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic for discussion

4.1 Protection Goals ([EFSA-Q-2013-00289](#))

The working group revised part of the draft Guidance taking into consideration the comments received at the public consultation.

Particular attention was given to clarifying the examples of application of the framework for the identification of Specific Protection Goals in the different fields under the remit of EFSA.

The issue of whether habitat can be considered as an ecological entity or whether it is intrinsically covered by protecting populations or communities was extensively debated. Also the issue of its operationalization within the ERA procedure was considered. In addition, concerns were raised whether "sustainability of agricultural systems" and "landscape structure" are attributes of the SPG that can be operationalized in prospective ERA schemes for regulated products like PPPs, feed additives and GMOs.

It was decided to hold an additional working group meeting in order to further debate on the remaining issues. Because of the need for further discussion, the Guidance will not be presented at the Scientific Committee plenary session scheduled on 11-12 November but rather in the February 2016 plenary session.

5. Any Other Business: none

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Scientific Committee and Emerging Risks (SCER) UNIT

Scientific Committee

Minutes of the 39th meeting of the Working Group on overarching elements of environmental risk assessment

Teleconference

Held on 13 October 2015

(Agreed on 21 October 2015)

Participants

- **Working Group Members**
 - Theo Brock (Chair), Robert Luttik, Joerg Romeis, Joe Perry
- **Hearing Experts¹:**
 - Not Applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not Applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - SCER Unit: Angelo Maggiore
 - GMO Unit : Yann Devos
- **Others**
 - Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest³, EFSA screened the Annual Declarations of Interest and the Specific Declarations of Interest filled in by the working group member invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting were identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic for discussion

4.1 Protection Goals ([EFSA-Q-2013-00289](#))

The working group addressed the public consultation comments that hadn't been answered at the previous meeting.

The WG amended the draft Guidance where appropriate. Particular attention was given in clarifying the issue of reconciliation of agricultural production and farmland biodiversity (conservation) and the criteria for the selection of an ES for ERA.

Further challenges arising from the development of a framework for the identification of Specific Protection Goals accounting for biodiversity and the ecosystem services approach were highlighted.

An additional working group meeting is scheduled on 21 October in Parma with the aim of finalizing the draft Guidance and the answers to the public consultation comments.

5. Any Other Business: none

6. Next meetings

- 21 October (9-13.00 CET) 2015 Protection Goals - SC ERA WG meeting, Parma

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Scientific Committee and Emerging Risks (SCER) UNIT

Scientific Committee

Minutes of the 38th meeting of the Working Group on overarching elements of environmental risk assessment

Held on 28-30 September 2015 in Parma (Italy)

(Agreed on 13 October 2015)

Participants

- **Working Group Members**

- Robert Luttik, Theo Brock (Chair), Claus Svendsen (28+29 September), Michael Bonsall, Ad Ragas, Gianni Gilioli (29 + 30 September) and Paulo Sousa
- Jonathan Jeschke (29 pm + 30 September) participated via teleconference

- **Hearing Experts¹:**

- Not Applicable

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

- Not Applicable

- **EFSA:**

- SCER Unit: Reinhilde Schoonjans
- GMO Unit : Fernando Alvarez (30 September)

- **Others**

- Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Mira Kattwinkel.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest³, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group member invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting were identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 37th Working Group held on 23-24 September 2015, Parma (Italy).

The minutes of the of the 37th Working Group meeting held on 23-24 September 2015 were agreed.⁴

5. Scientific topic for discussion

5.1 Endangered Species ([EFSA-Q-2013-00901](#))

147 comments were received from the public consultation and the consultation with the RA agencies. All Sections of the opinion received comments. Recurrent and high impact comments were first discussed in their general context and then answered case-by-case. Each individual comment was answered and amendments were made to the draft scientific opinion as appropriate. All comments were considered constructive and contributed to refinements of the draft opinion. The meeting time was extended by having an additional 2 hour teleconference on 16 October, in order for the experts to read-through the final draft of the opinion.

Some general comments were pointing towards the need for holistic approaches to environmental risk assessments. In general, the 3 ERA documents are perceived as a step in the right direction, but still on single-stressor risk assessments. Since EFSA operates in its current legal framework, some comments about multiple stressors could not be fully taken into account.

The level of impaired viability of the population of endangered species is a fundamental data input before starting ERA. However, such data are very often only available at local scale. Also the definition of endangered species, chosen as a working definition for this opinion, will remain scale-dependent.

6. Any Other Business: none

7. Next meetings

- 13 Oct: PG teleconference.
- 16 Oct ES extension teleconference
- 11 November 2015, open SC plenary meeting in Brussels.

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/scerwgs/documents/era_overarching.pdf

Scientific Committee and Emerging Risks (SCER) UNIT

Scientific Committee

Minutes of the 37th meeting of the Working Group on overarching elements of environmental risk assessment

Held on 23-24 September 2015 in Parma (Italy)

(Agreed on 28 September 2015)

Participants

- **Working Group Members**
 - Theo Brock (Chair), Robert Luttik, Joerg Romeis, Wopke vander Werf
 - Joe Perry (23 and 24 September) and Tony Hardy (23 September) have participated via teleconference
- **Hearing Experts¹:**
 - Not Applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not Applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - SCER Unit: Angelo Maggiore
- **Others**
 - Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest³, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group member invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting were identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic for discussion

4.1 Protection Goals ([EFSA-Q-2013-00289](#))

The comments received in the public consultation were first discussed in their general context. Subsequently they were each individually addressed by the working group.

The WG started amending the draft Guidance where appropriate. Particular attention was given in clarifying for whom the guidance document is intended.

The issues in the document that need future development were highlighted and distributed amongst the expert for further elaboration. A teleconference is scheduled on 13 Oct to prepare for the additional working group meeting on 21 Oct.

5. Any Other Business

5.1 Not Applicable

6. Next meetings

- 28 September (14-18.00 CET) + 29 September (9-18.00 CET) + 30 September (9-13.00 CET) 2015 ENDANGERED SPECIES - SC ERA WG meeting, Parma.
- 13 October (9-13.00 CET) 2015 PROTECTION GOALS - SC ERA WG meeting, Parma.
- 21 October (9-13.00 CET) 2015 PROTECTION GOALS - SC ERA WG meeting, Parma

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Scientific Committee and Emerging Risks Unit (SCER UNIT)

Scientific Committee

Minutes of the 36th meeting of the Working Group on overarching elements of environmental risk assessment

Held on 21-23 September, Parma (Italy)

(Agreed on 23 September 2015)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

- Franz Bigler, Theo Brock (Chair), Geoff Frampton (only 22-23), Robert Luttik (only 23), Fabrice Martin-Laurent, Chris Topping (all days apart from 22 morning) and Wopke Van der Werf

- **Hearing Experts¹:**

- Not Applicable

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

- Not Applicable

- **EFSA:**

- SCER Unit: Agnes Rortais and Stefania Volani

- **Others:**

- Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Geoff Frampton (1st day), Robert Luttik (1st and 2nd day) and Chris Topping (2nd day morning).

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted with no change.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest³, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting were identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 35th Working Group meeting held on 7th May 2015, Parma (Italy).

The minutes of the 35th Working Group meeting held on 7th May 2015 were agreed.⁴

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1 Recovery (EFSA-Q-2013-00902)

The WG addressed the comments from the Public Consultation in small sub-groups, in relation to the topics and expertise required. The answers provided by each sub-group were further circulated within the WG for discussion and adoption. Amendments to the scientific opinion were made directly in the report by the experts and further discussed with the whole WG. A merged version of both the amended scientific opinion and the list of comments and answers will be circulated to the WG by 2nd October for further checking and validation by the experts. Any potential issues that may arise will be further discussed in an ad-hoc teleconference meeting if needed. The amended scientific opinion will be presented to the next SC Plenary scheduled on 11-12 November 2015 for possible adoption by the SC.

6. Next meeting(s)

- Ad-hoc meetings, if needed, to be confirmed.

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/scerwgs/documents/era_overarching.pdf

Scientific Committee and Emerging Risks (SCER) UNIT

Scientific Committee

Minutes of the 35th meeting of the Working Group on overarching elements of environmental risk assessment

Held on 7 May 2015 in Parma (Italy)

(Agreed on 12 May 2015)

Participants

- **Working Group Members**
 - Robert Luttik (Chair), Theo Brock and Joerg Romeis (all via teleconference)
- **Hearing Experts¹:**
 - Not Applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not Applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - SCER Unit: Angelo Maggiore;
- **Others**
 - Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest³, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group member invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting were identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic for discussion

4.1 Protection Goals ([EFSA-Q-2013-00289](#))

The WG members discussed and addressed the comments made by the EFSA Panels (FEEDAP, GMO PPR and PLH) and the European Commission for each section of the document. Finally, the glossary section has been thoroughly revised for the Public Consultation.

5. Any Other Business

5.1 Not Applicable

6. Next meeting

- 21 September (14h00-18h00 CET), 22 September (9h00-18h00 CET) and 23 September (9h00-13h00 CET)

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Scientific Committee and Emerging Risks (SCER) UNIT

Scientific Committee

Minutes of the 34th meeting of the Working Group on overarching elements of environmental risk assessment

Held on 29-30 April 2015 in Parma (Italy)

(Agreed on 7 May 2015)

Participants

- **Working Group Members**
 - Theo Brock (Chair), , Robert Luttik, Fabrice Martin-Laurent, Chris Topping
 - Geoff Frampton (via TC on 29-30 April), Wopke Van der Werf (via TC on 29 April)
- **Hearing Experts¹:**
 - Not Applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not Applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - SCER Unit: Agnes Rortais and Stefania Volani
- **Others**
 - Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Franz Bigler (on 29-30 April) and from Wopke Van der Werf (on 30 April).

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest³, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group member invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting were identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 33rd Working Group held on 28-29th April 2015, Parma (Italy).

The minutes of the 33rd Working Group meeting held on 28-29 April 2015 will be agreed at the 35th Working group meeting on 7 May.⁴

5. Scientific topic for discussion

5.1 Recovery ([EFSA-Q-2013-00902](#))

The WG members discussed and addressed the comments made by the EFSA Panels (FEEDAP, GMO PPR and PLH) for each section of the scientific opinion including text, references, figures and appendices. Finally, the glossary section has been thoroughly revised for the Public Consultation. Final tasks were delegated to the EFSA staff and the WG members to insure consistency among the three ERA opinions, to complete the reference list and to finalise the last required edits.

6. Any Other Business

6.1 Not Applicable

7. Next meeting

- 21 September (14h00-18h00 CET), 22 September (9h00-18h00 CET) and 23 September (9h00-13h00 CET)

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/scerwgs/documents/era_overarching.pdf

Scientific Committee and Emerging Risks (SCER) UNIT

Scientific Committee

Minutes of the 33rd meeting of the Working Group on overarching elements of environmental risk assessment

Held on 28-29 April 2015 in Parma (Italy)

(Agreed on 30 April 2015)

Participants

- **Working Group Members**
 - Robert Luttik (Chair), Theo Brock, Claus Svendsen and Mira Kattwinkel
 - Ad Ragas, Jonathan Jeschke, Gianni Gilioli and Paulo Sousa have participated via teleconference
- **Hearing Experts¹:**
 - Not Applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not Applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - SCER Unit: Reinhilde Schoonjans
- **Others**
 - Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Michael Bonsall.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest³, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group member invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting were identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 32nd Working Group held on 5-6 March 2015, Parma (Italy).

The minutes of the of the 32nd Working Group meeting held on 5-6 March 2015 were agreed.⁴

5. Scientific topic for discussion

5.1 Endangered Species ([EFSA-Q-2013-00901](#))

The draft opinion was submitted to the PPR, GMO, PLH and FEEDAP Panels for providing input where requested and feedback. The comments received were addressed by the working group by amending the text where necessary. The meeting time was extended by having 2 additional teleconferences on 5 and 8 May. The level of impaired viability of the population of endangered species is a fundamental data input before starting ERA at European Scale. However, such data are very often only available at local scale. As this draft opinion is about single-stressor ERA schemes, comments about multiple stressors could not be fully taken into account. When discussing options for defining protection goals for endangered species in an agricultural context, the level of uncertainty was extensively discussed. This is however a general issue for all assessments.

6. Any Other Business

6.1 Not Applicable

7. Next meetings

- 29 April (14h00-18h00 CET) + 30 April (9h00-13h00 CET) 2015 RECOVERY- SC ERA WG meeting, Parma.
- 7 May (9.00-18.00 CET) 2015 PROTECTION GOALS – SC ERA WG meeting, Parma
- 21 September (14-18.00 CET) + 22 September (9-18.00 CET) + 23 September (9-13.00 CET) 2015 RECOVERY- SC ERA WG meeting, Parma
- 28 September (14-18.00 CET) + 29 September (9-18.00 CET) + 30 September (9-13.00 CET) 2015 ENDANGERED SPECIES - SC ERA WG meeting, Parma.

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/scerwgs/documents/era_overarching.pdf

Scientific Committee and Emerging Risks (SCER) UNIT

Scientific Committee

Minutes of the 32nd meeting of the Working Group on overarching elements of environmental risk assessment

Held on 5-6 March 2015 in Parma (Italy)

(Agreed on 28 April 2015)

Participants

- **Working Group Members**

- Robert Luttik (Chair), Tony Hardy, Theo Brock, Joerg Romeis, Wopke van der Werf
- Joe Perry and Christer Hogstrand have participated via teleconference

- **Hearing Experts¹:**

- Not Applicable

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

- Not Applicable

- **EFSA:**

- SCER Unit: Angelo Maggiore
- PRAS Unit : Jose Tarazona

- **Others**

- Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest³, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group member invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting were identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Scientific topic for discussion

4.1 Protection Goals ([EFSA-Q-2013-00289](#))

The feedback received from the Scientific Committee and the European Commission were discussed and resolved in each section. The criteria for the selection of the most appropriate option for each of the five dimensions and the interrelationship between dimensions were discussed and expanded. In addition, some terminology issues were raised, discussed and resolved.

5. Any Other Business

5.1 Not Applicable

6. Next meetings

- 28 April (13.30 -17.30 CET) + 29 April (9.00-13.00 CET) 2015 ENDANGERED SPECIES - SC ERA WG meeting, Parma.
- 29 April (14h00-18h00 CET) + 30 April (9h00-13h00 CET) 2015 RECOVERY- SC ERA WG meeting, Parma.
- 7 May (9.00-18.00 CET) 2015 PROTECTION GOALS – SC ERA WG meeting, Parma
- 21 September (14-18.00 CET) + 22 September (9-18.00 CET) + 23 September (9-13.00 CET) 2015 RECOVERY- SC ERA WG meeting, Parma
- 28 September (14-18.00 CET) + 29 September (9-18.00 CET) + 30 September (9-13.00 CET) 2015 ENDANGERED SPECIES - SC ERA WG meeting, Parma.

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

Scientific Committee and Emerging Risks (SCER) UNIT

Scientific Committee

Minutes of the 31st meeting of the Working Group on overarching elements of environmental risk assessment

Held on 4-5 March 2015 in Parma (Italy)

(Agreed on 5 March 2015)

Participants

- **Working Group Members**
 - Theo Brock (Chair), Franz Bigler and Geoff Frampton, Robert Luttik (on 5 March), Wopke Van der Werf (on 5 March)
 - Christopher Topping participated via teleconference
- **Hearing Experts¹:**
 - Not Applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not Applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - SCER Unit: Agnes Rortais
- **Others**
 - Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Robert Luttik and Wopke Van der Werf (on 4 March) and from Fabrice Martin-Laurent (on 4-5 March).

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest³, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group member invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 30th Working Group held on 23-24 February 2015, Parma (Italy).

The minutes of the of the 30th Working Group meeting held on 23-24 February 2015 were agreed.⁴

5. Scientific topic for discussion

5.1 Recovery ([EFSA-Q-2013-00902](#))

The feedback received from the Scientific Committee and extra remarks from the working group members were discussed and resolved in each section. A few remaining tasks were delegated to the working group members and EFSA staff, in particular on the glossary section.

6. Any Other Business

6.1 Not Applicable

7. Next meetings

- 5 March (14 – 18.00 CET) + 6 March (9.00 – 13.00 CET) 2015 PROTECTION GOALS- SC ERA WG meeting, Parma.
- 28 April (13.30 -17.30 CET) + 29 April (9.00-13.00 CET) 2015 ENDANGERED SPECIES - SC ERA WG meeting, Parma.
- 29 April (14h00-18h00 CET) + 30 April (9h00-13h00 CET) 2015 RECOVERY- SC ERA WG meeting, Parma.
- 7 May (9.00-18.00 CET) 2015 PROTECTION GOALS – SC ERA WG meeting, Parma
- 21 September (14-18.00 CET) + 22 September (9-18.00 CET) + 23 September (9-13.00 CET) 2015 RECOVERY- SC ERA WG meeting, Parma
- 28 September (14-18.00 CET) + 29 September (9-18.00 CET) + 30 September (9-13.00 CET) 2015 ENDANGERED SPECIES - SC ERA WG meeting, Parma.

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/scerwgs/documents/era_overarching.pdf

Scientific Committee and Emerging Risks (SCER) UNIT

Scientific Committee

Minutes of the 30th meeting of the Working Group on overarching elements of environmental risk assessment

Held on 23-24 February 2015 in Parma (Italy)

(Agreed on 4 March 2015)

Participants

- **Working Group Members**
 - Robert Luttik (Chair), Theo Brock, Ad Ragas, Claus Svendsen, Gianni Gilioli and Paulo Sousa
 - Jonathan Jeschke and Mira Kattwinkel have participated via teleconference
- **Hearing Experts¹:**
 - Not Applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not Applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - SCER Unit: Jean-Lou Dorne
- **Others**
 - Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Michael Bonsall.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest³, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group member invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 29th Working Group held on 26th January 2015, Parma (Italy).

The minutes of the of the 29th Working Group meeting held on 26 January 2015 were agreed.⁴

5. Scientific topic for discussion

5.1 Endangered Species ([EFSA-Q-2013-00901](#))

The feedback received from the Scientific Committee and extra remarks from the working group members were discussed and resolved in each section. Few remaining tasks were delegated to the working group members and EFSA staff. The main discussion point was the different levels at which the ERA of endangered species can be performed. Rewriting of that section is necessary.

6. Any Other Business

6.1 Not Applicable

7. Next meetings

- 4 March (14 -18.00 CET) + 5 March (8.00-12.00 CET) 2015 RECOVERY- SC ERA WG meeting, Parma.
- 5 March (14 – 18.00 CET) + 6 March (9.00 – 13.00 CET) 2015 PROTECTION GOALS- SC ERA WG meeting, Parma.
- 28 April (13.30 -17.30 CET) + 29 April (9.00-13.00 CET) 2015 ENDANGERED SPECIES - SC ERA WG meeting, Parma.
- 29 April (14h00-18h00 CET) + 30 April (9h00-13h00 CET) 2015 RECOVERY- SC ERA WG meeting, Parma.
- 7 May (9.00-18.00 CET) 2015 PROTECTION GOALS – SC ERA WG meeting, Parma
- 21 September (14-18.00 CET) + 22 September (9-18.00 CET) + 23 September (9-13.00 CET) 2015 RECOVERY- SC ERA WG meeting, Parma
- 28 September (14-18.00 CET) + 29 September (9-18.00 CET) + 30 September (9-13.00 CET) 2015 ENDANGERED SPECIES - SC ERA WG meeting, Parma.

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/scerwgs/documents/era_overarching.pdf

Scientific Committee and Emerging Risks (SCER) UNIT

Scientific Committee

Minutes of the 29th meeting of the Working Group on overarching elements of environmental risk assessment

by TELE-conference

Held on 26 January 2015 in Parma (Italy)

(Agreed on 23 February 2015)

Participants

- **Working Group Members**
 - Robert Luttik (Chair), Theo Brock, Joerg Romeis, Wopke Van der Werf, Joe Perry and Tony Hardy
- **Hearing Experts¹:**
 - Not Applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not Applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - SCER Unit: Angelo Maggiore
- **Others**
 - Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest³, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting were identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 28th Working Group held on 23 January 2015, Parma (Italy).

The minutes of the of the 28th Working Group meeting held on 23 January 2015 were agreed.⁴

5. Scientific topic for discussion

5.1 Protection Goals ([EFSA-Q-2013-00289](#))

The feedback received from the European Commission was discussed in detail and the necessary tasks to handle it were distributed among the working group members. The text relative to the three proposed steps to conduct the environmental risk assessment (identification of relevant ecosystem services, identification of the units supporting/providing the relevant services and the specification of the degree/parameters of protection, through the use of interrelated dimensions) has been discussed and amended, with particular focus on the criteria for the selection of the most appropriate option for each dimension. It was agreed to discuss the sections on conclusions, challenges and recommendations after the redrafting that will occur a few days after the meeting. The task allocation among the working group members to finalise the drafting was agreed.

6. Any Other Business

6.1 Not Applicable

7. Next meetings

- 23 February (13.30 -17.30 CET) + 24 February (9.00-13.00 CET) 2015: ENDANGERED SPECIES - SC ERA WG meeting, Parma.
- 4 March (14 -18.00 CET) + 5 March (8.00-12.00 CET) 2015 RECOVERY- SC ERA WG meeting, Parma
- 5 March (14 – 18.00 CET) + 6 March (9.00 – 13.00 CET) 2015 PROTECTION GOALS- SC ERA WG meeting, Parma
- 28 May (13.30 -17.30 CET) + 29 May (9.00-13.00 CET) 2015: ENDANGERED SPECIES - SC ERA WG meeting, Parma.

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/scerwgs/documents/era_overarching.pdf

Scientific Committee and Emerging Risks Unit (SCER UNIT)

Scientific Committee/Unit

Minutes of the 28th meeting of the Working Group on overarching elements of environmental risk assessment

by TELE-conference

Held on 23 January, Parma (Italy)

(Agreed on 26 January 2015)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**
 - Theo Brock (Chair), Geoff Frampton, Robert Luttik, Fabrice Martin-Laurent and Wopke Van der Werf
 - Chris Topping (physically)
- **Hearing Experts¹:**
 - Not Applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not Applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - SCER Unit: Agnes Rortais and Stefania Volani
- **Others:**
 - Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Franz Bigler, Franz Streissl and Sybren Vos.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without any changes.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest³, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 27th Working Group meeting held on 20 January 2015, Parma (Italy).

The minutes of the 27th Working Group meeting held on 20 January 2015 were agreed.⁴

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1 Recovery ([EFSA-Q-2013-00902](#))

After checking the status of the action points from the last meeting on Recovery (i.e. on 5-6.01.2015), the WG discussed and approved the new sections and clarifications included in the new version of the scientific opinion. All comments and edits were addressed. In particular, the sections related to the "abstract", "summary", main sections of the scientific opinion, "conclusions" and "recommendations". Last edits (style, references, acronyms, etc.) will be made by 29th January 2015 and the draft scientific opinion will be sent to the Scientific Committee as scheduled to be further discussed at the next SC Plenary scheduled on 18-19 of February 2015.

6. Next meeting(s)

- 26 January (09.00 – 13.00 CET) 2015: PROTECTION GOALS – Teleconference
- SC Plenary on 18 – 19 February – 1st reading of the three SOs
- 23 February (13.30 -17.30 CET) + 24 February (9.00-13.00 CET) 2015: ENDANGERED SPECIES - SC ERA WG meeting, Parma
- 4 March (14 -18.00 CET) + 5 March (8.00-12.00 CET) 2015 RECOVERY- SC ERA WG meeting, Parma
- 5 March (14 – 18.00 CET) + 6 March (9.00 – 13.00 CET) 2015 PROTECTION GOALS- SC ERA WG meeting, Parma

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/scerwgs/documents/era_overarching.pdf

Scientific Committee and Emerging Risks (SCER) UNIT

Scientific Committee

Minutes of the 27th meeting of the Working Group on overarching elements of environmental risk assessment

Telemeeting, 20 January 2015

(Agreed on 23 January 2015)

Participants

- **Working Group Members**
 - Robert Luttik (Chair) ; Theo Brock, Mira Kattwinkel, Ad Ragas, Claus Svendsen, Gianni Gilioli, Michael Bonsall, Jonathan Jeschke.
- **Hearing Experts¹:**
 - Not Applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not Applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - SCER Unit: Reinhilde Schoonjans
- **Others**
 - Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Paulo Sousa.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

Scientific Committee and Emerging Risks Unit (SCER UNIT)

Scientific Committee/Unit

Minutes of the 28th meeting of the Working Group on overarching elements of environmental risk assessment

by TELE-conference

Held on 23 January, Parma (Italy)

(Agreed on 26 January 2015)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

- Theo Brock (Chair), Geoff Frampton, Robert Luttik, Fabrice Martin-Laurent and Wopke Van der Werf
- Chris Topping (physically)

- **Hearing Experts¹:**

- Not Applicable

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

- Not Applicable

- **EFSA:**

- SCER Unit: Agnes Rortais and Stefania Volani

- **Others:**

- Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Franz Bigler, Franz Streissl and Sybren Vos.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without any changes.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest³, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 27th Working Group meeting held on 20 January 2015, Parma (Italy).

The minutes of the 27th Working Group meeting held on 20 January 2015 were agreed.⁴

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1 Recovery ([EFSA-Q-2013-00902](#))

After checking the status of the action points from the last meeting on Recovery (i.e. on 5-6.01.2015), the WG discussed and approved the new sections and clarifications included in the new version of the scientific opinion. All comments and edits were addressed. In particular, the sections related to the "abstract", "summary", main sections of the scientific opinion, "conclusions" and "recommendations". Last edits (style, references, acronyms, etc.) will be made by 29th January 2015 and the draft scientific opinion will be sent to the Scientific Committee as scheduled to be further discussed at the next SC Plenary scheduled on 18-19 of February 2015.

6. Next meeting(s)

- 26 January (09.00 – 13.00 CET) 2015: PROTECTION GOALS – Teleconference
- SC Plenary on 18 – 19 February – 1st reading of the three SOs
- 23 February (13.30 -17.30 CET) + 24 February (9.00-13.00 CET) 2015: ENDANGERED SPECIES - SC ERA WG meeting, Parma
- 4 March (14 -18.00 CET) + 5 March (8.00-12.00 CET) 2015 RECOVERY- SC ERA WG meeting, Parma
- 5 March (14 – 18.00 CET) + 6 March (9.00 – 13.00 CET) 2015 PROTECTION GOALS- SC ERA WG meeting, Parma

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/scerwgs/documents/era_overarching.pdf

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest³, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group member invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 26th Working Group held on 7-8 January 2015, Parma (Italy).

The minutes of the of the 26th Working Group meeting held on 7-8 January 2015 were agreed.⁴

5. Scientific topic for discussion

5.1 Endangered Species ([EFSA-Q-2013-00901](#))

The contributions and new comments received were resolved. The section on coverage of endangered species is now also finalized. The conclusions, recommendations, draft summary require further streamlining. The abstract was approved. In order to discuss further Appendix C, this meeting was extended on the 22nd of January with the concerned experts only. The SCER scientists will coordinate the editing, references, glossary and abbreviations and the consistency check with the 2 other parallel opinions on protection goals and on recovery needs to be ensured. End January, the draft opinion will be submitted to the Scientific Committee for a first reading at the 18-19 Feb plenary meeting. To address the SC comments, a next WG meeting is scheduled for 23-24 February. From 9 March, the respective EFSA Panels will be consulted until 20 April.

6. Any Other Business

6.1 Not Applicable

7. Next meetings

- 23 January (13.00 – 17.00 CET) Teleconference RECOVERY
- 23 February (13.30 -17.30 CET) + 24 February (9.00-13.00 CET) 2015: ENDANGERED SPECIES - SC ERA WG meeting, Parma.
- 4 March (14 -18.00 CET) + 5 March (8.00-12.00 CET) 2015 RECOVERY- SC ERA WG meeting, Parma
- 5 March (14 – 18.00 CET) + 6 March (9.00 – 13.00 CET) 2015 PROTECTION GOALS- SC ERA WG meeting, Parma
- 28 May (13.30 -17.30 CET) + 29 May (9.00-13.00 CET) 2015: ENDANGERED SPECIES - SC ERA WG meeting, Parma.

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/scerwgs/documents/era_overarching.pdf

Scientific Committee and Emerging Risks (SCER) UNIT

Scientific Committee

Minutes of the 26th meeting of the Working Group on overarching elements of environmental risk assessment

Held on 7-8 January 2015 in Parma (Italy)

(Agreed on 20 January 2015)

Participants

- **Working Group Members**
 - Robert Luttik (Chair) ; Theo Brock, Joerg Romeis, Christer Hogstrand
 - Joe Perry and Tony Hardy participated via teleconference
- **Hearing Experts¹:**
 - Not Applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not Applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - SCER Unit: Angelo Maggiore
 - GMO Unit : Yann Devos
- **Others**
 - Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest³, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group member invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 25th Working Group held on 6-7 January 2015, Parma (Italy).

The minutes of the of the 25th Working Group meeting held on 6-7 January 2015 were agreed.⁴

5. Scientific topic for discussion

5.1 Protection Goals ([EFSA-Q-2013-00289](#))

The criteria for the selection of the most appropriate option for each of the six dimensions were discussed and expanded. Also the examples of how ecosystem services, service providing units and their six dimensions can be used to define specific protection goals in the problem formulation were discussed and the need of a clearer explanation of the reasoning behind the selection of a certain option for the six dimensions was envisaged. This will be addressed by mid-january. The conclusions also need some redrafting.

An additional teleconference will be scheduled before the end of January. Then, the draft opinion will be submitted to the Scientific Committee for a first reading at the 18-19 Feb plenary meeting.

6. Any Other Business

6.1 Not Applicable

7. Next meetings

- 20 January (9.30 – 11.30 CET): Teleconference ENDANGERED SPECIES
- 23 January (13.00 – 17.00 CET) Teleconference RECOVERY
- 23 February (13.30 -17.30 CET) + 24 February (9.00-13.00 CET) 2015: ENDANGERED SPECIES - SC ERA WG meeting, Parma.
- 4 March (14 -18.00 CET) + 5 March (8.00-12.00 CET) 2015 RECOVERY- SC ERA WG meeting, Parma
- 5 March (14 – 18.00 CET) + 6 March (9.00 – 13.00 CET) 2015 PROTECTION GOALS- SC ERA WG meeting, Parma
- 28 May (13.30 -17.30 CET) + 29 May (9.00-13.00 CET) 2015: ENDANGERED SPECIES - SC ERA WG meeting, Parma.

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/scerwgs/documents/era_overarching.pdf

Scientific Committee and Emerging Risks (SCER) UNIT

Scientific Committee

Minutes of the 25th meeting of the Working Group on overarching elements of environmental risk assessment

Held on 6-7 January 2015 in Parma (Italy)

(Agreed on 8 January 2015)

Participants

- **Working Group Members**

- Robert Luttik (Chair) ; Theo Brock, Mira Kattwinkel, Ad Ragas, Claus Svendsen, Gianni Gilioli, Michael Bonsall, Paulo Sousa
- Jonathan Jeschke participated via teleconference

- **Hearing Experts¹:**

- Not Applicable

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

- Not Applicable

- **EFSA:**

- SCER Unit: Reinhilde Schoonjans, Jean-Lou Dorne

- **Others**

- Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest³, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group member invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 24th Working Group held on 5-6 January 2015, Parma (Italy).

The minutes of the of the 24th Working Group meeting held on 5-6 January 2015 were agreed.⁴

5. Scientific topic for discussion

5.1 Endangered Species (EFSA-Q-2013-00901)

<http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2013-00901>

All Chapters of the draft opinion are now entering the finalisation stage. More suggestions and comments were introduced in the text for the experts to address by mid January. All chapters still need revisions and the conclusions need extra time. An additional teleconference will be scheduled on 20 January. EFSA SCER scientists will coordinate the editing, references, glossary and abbreviations and the consistency check with the 2 other parallel opinions on protection goals and on recovery needs to be ensured. End January, the draft opinion will be submitted to the Scientific Committee for a first reading at the 18-19 Feb plenary meeting. To address the SC comments, a next WG meeting is scheduled for 23-24 February. From 9 March, the respective EFSA Panels will be consulted until 20 April.

6. Any Other Business

6.1 Not Applicable

7. Next meetings

- 7 January (14.00 -18.00 CET) + 8 January (9.00-13.00 CET) 2015 PROTECTION GOALS- SC ERA WG meeting, Parma
- 20 January (9.30 – 11.30 CET): Teleconference ENDANGERED SPECIES
- 23 January (13.00 – 17.00 CET) Teleconference RECOVERY
- 23 February (13.30 -17.30 CET) + 24 February (9.00-13.00 CET) 2015: ENDANGERED SPECIES - SC ERA WG meeting, Parma.
- 4 March (14 -18.00 CET) + 5 March (8.00-12.00 CET) 2015 RECOVERY- SC ERA WG meeting, Parma
- 5 March (14 – 18.00 CET) + 6 March (9.00 – 13.00 CET) 2015 PROTECTION GOALS- SC ERA WG meeting, Parma

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/scerwgs/documents/era_overarching.pdf

- 28 May (13.30 -17.30 CET) + 29 May (9.00-13.00 CET) 2015: ENDANGERED SPECIES
- SC ERA WG meeting, Parma.

Scientific Committee and Emerging Risks (SCER) UNIT

Scientific Committee/Unit

Minutes of the 24th meeting of the Working Group on overarching elements of environmental risk assessment

Held on 5-6 January, Parma (Italy)

(Agreed on 6 January 2015)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

- Theo Brock (Chair), Franz Biggler, Geoff Frampton, Robert Luttik, Fabrice Martin-Laurent and Chris Topping
- Wopke Van der Werf via TC

- **Hearing Experts¹:**

- Not Applicable

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

- Not Applicable

- **EFSA:**

- SCER Unit: Agnes Rortais, Reinhilde Schoonjans, Stefania Volani

- **Others:**

- Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Franz Streissl and Sybren Vos.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted with no change.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest³, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 23rd Working Group meeting held on 10 December 2014, Parma (Italy).

The minutes of the of the 23rd Working Group meeting held on 10 December 2014 were agreed.⁴

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1 Recovery ([EFSA-Q-2013-00902](#))

After checking the status of the action points from the last meeting on Recovery (i.e. on 5.12.2014), the WG discussed and approved the new sections and clarifications included in the new version of the scientific opinion. In particular, the last two sections on "the conceptual framework" (including aspects on the selection of focal species and appropriate spatial and temporal scales) and "the scope for the ecological recovery" were extensively discussed (these two sections will be merged into one). All comments and edits were addressed and few new action points were identified to be addressed and approved at the final TC meeting on recovery (i.e. on 23.01.2015). The section on "conclusions" was also extensively discussed and a list of challenges was identified. This list as well as the sections related to the "abstract", "summary" and "recommendations" and all new action points will be approved at the next TC meeting to produce a final draft to be presented at the 71st Plenary of the Scientific Committee (i.e. on 18-19.02.2015). A meeting was scheduled with the WG on 4-5.03.2015 to address the comments of the Scientific Committee on the draft scientific opinion.

6. Any Other Business

6.1 Not Applicable

7. Next meeting(s)

- 6 January (14.00 -18.00 CET) + 7 January (9.00-13.00 CET) 2015 ENDANGERED SPECIES - SC ERA WG meeting, Parma
- 7 January (14.00 -18.00 CET) + 8 January (9.00-13.00 CET) 2015 PROTECTION GOALS- SC ERA WG meeting, Parma
- 23 January (13.00 – 17.00 CET) Teleconference RECOVERY
- 23 February (13.30 -17.30 CET) + 24 February (9.00-13.00 CET) 2015: ENDANGERED SPECIES - SC ERA WG meeting, Parma

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/scerwgs/documents/era_overarching.pdf

- 4 March (14 -18.00 CET) + 5 March (8.00-12.00 CET) 2015 RECOVERY- SC ERA WG meeting, Parma
- 5 March (14 – 18.00 CET) + 6 March (9.00 – 13.00 CET) 2015 PROTECTION GOALS- SC ERA WG meeting, Parma

Scientific Committee and Emerging Risks Unit (SCER UNIT)

Scientific Committee/Unit

Minutes of the 23rd meeting of the Working Group on overarching elements of environmental risk assessment

by TELE-conference, 10 December 2014

(Agreed on 5 Jan 2015)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

Robert Luttik (Chair); Tony Hardy; Joe Perry; Joerg Romeis; Wopke Van der Werf ¹; Christer Hogstrand¹

- **Hearing Experts²:**

- Not Applicable

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

- Not Applicable

- **EFSA:**

- SCER Unit: Reinhilde Schoonjans; Angelo Maggiore

- **Others:**

- Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Theo Brock.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ Am only

² As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes³ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest⁴, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 21th and 22nd Working Group meetings held on 5 December, Parma.

The minutes of the of the 21th and 22nd Working Group meetings held on 5 December 2014 were agreed.⁵

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1 Protection Goals (EFSA-Q-2013-00289)

<http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2013-00289>

All chapters were reviewed, and the contributions and comments received by the members of the WG addressed and implemented as deemed appropriate. A set of new suggestions (in particular related to general protection goals for plant health, extent of protection for biodiversity, examples of application of the six dimensions approach) were recorded for follow-up by the next meeting on 7-8 January 2015. The background information contained in Chapter 1 will be restructured. Chapter 2 will be expanded and some clarifications will be added. Chapter 3 (Conclusions) and 4 (Challenges) will be checked and the need of further development evaluated by the WG. Some additional information on how to optimise the interaction between risk managers and risk assessors will be asked from the European Commission.

6. Next meeting(s)

- 5 January (14.00 -18.00 CET) + 6 January (9.00-13.00 CET) 2015 RECOVERY- SC ERA WG meeting, Parma
- 6 January (14.00 -18.00 CET) + 7 January (9.00-13.00 CET) 2015 ENDANGERED SPECIES - SC ERA WG meeting, Parma
- 7 January (14.00 -18.00 CET) + 8 January (9.00-13.00 CET) 2015 PROTECTION GOALS- SC ERA WG meeting, Parma
- 23 February (13.30 -17.30 CET) + 24 February (9.00-13.00 CET) 2015: ENDANGERED SPECIES - SC ERA WG meeting, Parma

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁵ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/scerwgs/documents/era_overarching.pdf

Scientific Committee and Emerging Risks Unit (SCER UNIT)

Scientific Committee/Unit

Minutes of the 22th TC meeting of the Working Group on overarching elements of environmental risk assessment

Held on 5 December 2014, Parma (Italy)

(Agreed on 10th December 2014)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

- Theo Brock (Chair), Franz Biggler, Geoff Frampton, Fabrice Martin-Laurent, Chris Topping, Wopke Van der Werf

- **Hearing Experts¹:**

- Not Applicable

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

- Not Applicable

- **EFSA:**

- SCER Unit: Agnes Rortais

- **Others:**

- Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from Robert Luttik, Franz Streissl and Sybren Vos.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted with no change.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest³, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 21st Working Group meeting held on 5 December 2014, Parma (Italy).

The minutes of the of the 21st Working Group meeting held on 5 December 2014 were agreed.⁴

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1 Recovery (EFSA-Q-2013-00902)

The WG discussed the addition of new information on adaptation to address the term of reference dealing with the importance of genetic diversity when assessing ecological recovery. The sections related to the scope of the opinion, the introduction, the data and methodology as well as the following sections on landscape and regulated stressor properties were revised and validated by the WG. New sections regarding the general presentation of the regulated stressors and the conceptual framework (including aspects on the selection of focal species and appropriate spatial and temporal scales) will be drafted and revised at the next meeting scheduled on 5 and 6 January 2015. A meeting will be scheduled with the WG just after the 71th Plenary meeting of the Scientific Committee to address the comments of the Scientific Committee on the draft scientific opinion.

6. Next meeting(s)

- 5 December (9.30-13.00 + 14-17.30): Teleconference ENDANGERED SPECIES
- 10 December: Teleconference PROTECTION GOALS
- 5 January (14.00 -18.00 CET) + 6 January (9.00-13.00 CET) 2015 RECOVERY- SC ERA WG meeting, Parma
- 6 January (14.00 -18.00 CET) + 7 January (9.00-13.00 CET) 2015 ENDANGERED SPECIES - SC ERA WG meeting, Parma
- 7 January (14.00 -18.00 CET) + 8 January (9.00-13.00 CET) 2015 PROTECTION GOALS- SC ERA WG meeting, Parma
- 23 January (13.00 – 17.00 CET) Teleconference RECOVERY
- 23 February (13.30 -17.30 CET) + 24 February (9.00-13.00 CET) 2015: ENDANGERED SPECIES - SC ERA WG meeting, Parma

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencypolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/scerwgs/documents/era_overarching.pdf

Scientific Committee and Emerging Risks Unit (SCER UNIT)

Scientific Committee/Unit

Minutes of the 21st meeting of the Working Group on overarching elements of environmental risk assessment

by TELE-conference, 05 December 2014

(Agreed on 10 December 2014)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

- Robert Luttik (Chair); Mira Kattwinkel, Ad Ragas, Gianni Gilioli, Michael Bonsall, Paulo Sousa, Jonathan Jeschke

- **Hearing Experts¹:**

- Not Applicable

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

- Not Applicable

- **EFSA:**

- SCER Unit: Reinhilde Schoonjans
- GMO Unit : Fernando Alvarez

- **Others:**

- Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Theo Brock and Claus Svendsen.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest³, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 20th Working Group meeting held on 20-21 November, Parma.

The minutes of the of the 20th Working Group meeting held on 20-21 November 2014 were agreed in the parallel meeting on the recovery opinion.⁴

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1 Endangered Species (EFSA-Q-2013-00901)

<http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2013-00901>

All chapters were reviewed and the drafted interim conclusions refined at the meeting. A set of new suggestions and comments were recorded for follow-up by the next meeting on 6-7 January 2015. Chapter 1 is near to final and Chapter 2 and 4 need to be finalised for trait-based approaches. Chapter 3 comprises now all contributions for the evaluation of the ERA schemes in the 4 sectors. Balancing out the level of detail is the focus of the next revision. Chapters 5 and 6 are now reviewed in their full extent and the WG considered the information adequate. Some more info on monitoring activities will be asked from the observers.

6. Next meeting(s)

- 10 December: Teleconference PROTECTION GOALS
- 5 January (14.00 -18.00 CET) + 6 January (9.00-13.00 CET) 2015 RECOVERY- SC ERA WG meeting, Parma
- 6 January (14.00 -18.00 CET) + 7 January (9.00-13.00 CET) 2015 ENDANGERED SPECIES - SC ERA WG meeting, Parma
- 7 January (14.00 -18.00 CET) + 8 January (9.00-13.00 CET) 2015 PROTECTION GOALS- SC ERA WG meeting, Parma
- 23 February (13.30 -17.30 CET) + 24 February (9.00-13.00 CET) 2015: ENDANGERED SPECIES - SC ERA WG meeting, Parma

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/scerwgs/documents/era_overarching.pdf

Scientific Committee and Emerging Risks Unit (SCER UNIT)

Scientific Committee/Unit

Minutes of the 20th meeting of the Working Group on overarching elements of environmental risk assessment

Held on 20-21 November 2014, Parma (Italy)

(Agreed on 5th December 2014)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**

- Theo Brock (Chair), Franz Biggler, Geoff Frampton, Robert Luttik, Fabrice Martin-Laurent, Chris Topping,
- Wopke Van der Werf has participated via teleconference

- **Hearing Experts¹:**

- Not Applicable

- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**

- Not Applicable

- **EFSA:**

- PRAS Unit: Franz Streissl
- SCER Unit: Agnes Rortais

- **Others:**

- Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted with the addition of the consideration of a specific item from the ToR (genetic diversity).

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest³, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 19th Working Group meeting held on 17 October 2014, Parma (Italy).

The minutes of the of the 19th Working Group meeting held on 17 October 2014 were agreed.⁴

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1 Recovery (EFSA-Q-2013-00902)

The chapter on the conceptual framework for addressing recovery was revised in order to cover all regulated stressors (e.g. the factors/traits described in this section were all dealing with structural recovery; not with functional recovery). A new text was added to better reflect on this and will be revised by the WG at the next meeting. The chapter on "the need for an integrative approach and the identification of the appropriate spatio-temporal scales, including the selection of focal species" was discussed in depth and action points were determined to fully address those, including focal functions in the case of microbes. This new text will be revised by the WG during the next meeting. Then, the WG discussed the addition of new information on adaptation to address the term of reference dealing with the importance of genetic diversity when assessing ecological recovery. Finally, the introduction and methodology section were discussed and it was agreed that new information should be provided in those sections to better define the scope and structure of the report. The next version implementing the proposed amendments and the necessary development will be circulated before the next telemeeting, scheduled on 5th December. A teleconference meeting was scheduled on 23 January (pm) 2016, in case there is further work needed on the polishing of the report before it is sent to the SC end of January 2016 for its first reading.

6. Next meeting(s)

- 20 November (14.00 -18.00 CET) + 21 November (9.00-13.00 CET) 2014: RECOVERY - SC ERA WG meeting, Parma
- 5 December (9.30-13.00 + 14-17.30): Teleconference ENDANGERED SPECIES
- 5 December : Teleconference RECOVERY
- 10 December: Teleconference PROTECTION GOALS
- 5 January (14.00 -18.00 CET) + 6 January (9.00-13.00 CET) 2015 RECOVERY- SC ERA WG meeting, Parma
- 6 January (14.00 -18.00 CET) + 7 January (9.00-13.00 CET) 2015 ENDANGERED SPECIES - SC ERA WG meeting, Parma

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/scerwgs/documents/era_overarching.pdf

- 7 January (14.00 -18.00 CET) + 8 January (9.00-13.00 CET) 2015 PROTECTION GOALS- SC ERA WG meeting, Parma
- 23 January (13.00 – 17.00 CET) Teleconference RECOVERY
- 23 February (13.30 -17.30 CET) + 24 February (9.00-13.00 CET) 2015: ENDANGERED SPECIES - SC ERA WG meeting, Parma

Scientific Committee and Emerging Risks Unit (SCER UNIT)

Scientific Committee/Unit

Minutes of the 19th meeting of the Working Group on overarching elements of environmental risk assessment

Held on 13-14 November 2014, Parma (Italy)

(Agreed on 20 November 2014)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**
 - Robert Luttik (Chair), Tony Hardy
 - Joe Perry, Wopke Van der Werf and Theo Brock¹ have participated via teleconference
- **Hearing Experts²:**
 - Not Applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not Applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - SCER Unit: Reinhilde Schoonjans, Angelo Maggiore
- **Others:**
 - Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Jörg Romeis and Christer Hogstrand.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes³ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest⁴, EFSA

¹ On 13 November

² As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 18th Working Group meeting held on 3-4 November 2014, Parma (Italy).

The minutes of the of the 18th Working Group meeting held on 3-4 November 2014 were agreed.⁵

5. Scientific topic(s) for discussion

5.1 Protection Goals (EFSA-Q-2013-00289)

<http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2013-00289>

All chapters were discussed for further development. In chapter 1, the description of the interrelationships between biodiversity and ecosystem services and how to practically implement them, were developed and agreed. New elements, such as how to reflect considerations on effect and exposure assessment in the definition of the specific protection goal, were taken on board as deemed appropriate. The definition of the options for the six dimensions and development of appropriate criteria for the selection of the most appropriate option were the focus of the meeting. Furthermore, the examples of how the six dimensions can be used to define protection goals were streamlined. Finally, the challenges and recommendations related to the ecosystem service/biodiversity approach were discussed. The next version implementing the proposed amendments and the necessary development will be circulated before the next telemeeting, scheduled on 10th December.

6. Next meeting(s)

- 20 November (14.00 -18.00 CET) + 21 November (9.00-13.00 CET) 2014: RECOVERY - SC ERA WG meeting, Parma
- 5 December (9.30-13.00 + 14-17.30): Teleconference ENDANGERED SPECIES
- 10 December: Teleconference PROTECTION GOALS
- X December : Teleconference RECOVERY
- 5 January (14.00 -18.00 CET) + 6 January (9.00-13.00 CET) 2015 RECOVERY- SC ERA WG meeting, Parma
- 6 January (14.00 -18.00 CET) + 7 January (9.00-13.00 CET) 2015 ENDANGERED SPECIES - SC ERA WG meeting, Parma
- 7 January (14.00 -18.00 CET) + 8 January (9.00-13.00 CET) 2015 PROTECTION GOALS- SC ERA WG meeting, Parma
- 23 February (13.30 -17.30 CET) + 24 February (9.00-13.00 CET) 2015: ENDANGERED SPECIES - SC ERA WG meeting, Parma

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁵ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/scerwgs/documents/era_overarching.pdf

Scientific Committee and Emerging Risks Unit (SCER UNIT)

Scientific Committee/Unit

Minutes of the 18th meeting of the Working Group on overarching elements of environmental risk assessment

Held on 3-4 November 2014, Parma (Italy)

(Agreed on 13 November 2014)

Participants

- **Working Group Members:**
 - Robert Luttik (Chair), Theo Brock, Mira Kattwinkel, Ad Ragas, Claus Svendsen
 - Jonathan Jeschke has participated via teleconference¹
- **Hearing Experts²:**
 - Not Applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not Applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - SCER Unit: Reinhilde Schoonjans
 - GMO Unit : Fernando Alvarez
- **Others:**
 - Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Gianni Gilioli, Michael Bonsall, Paulo Sousa.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ On 4 November

² As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes³ and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest⁴, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group members invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 17th Working Group meeting held on 17 October 2017 VIDEO/WEB/TELE-conference

The minutes of the of the 17th Working Group meeting held on 17 October 2014 were agreed.⁵

5. Scientific topic for discussion

5.1 Endangered Species (EFSA-Q-2013-00901)

<http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2013-00901>

All members approved the structure of the document which allows to presented the information in a systematic and logical way. All chapters were discussed for further development. The working group members addressed comments and approved new text on at the meeting. Chapter 1 and 2 can enter the stage of finalisation. Chapter 3 misses some parts and chapter 4 is under full revision. Chapters 5 and 6 will be expanded. Interim conclusions will be reviewed at the next meeting on 5 December 2014.

6. Next meetings

- 13 November (14.00 -18.00 CET) + 14 November (9.00-13.30 CET) 2014: PROTECTION GOALS- SC ERA WG meeting, Parma
- 20 November (14.00 -18.00 CET) + 21 November (9.00-13.00 CET) 2014: RECOVERY - SC ERA WG meeting, Parma
- 5 December (9.30-13.00 + 14-17.30): Teleconference ENDANGERED SPECIES
- 10 December: Teleconference PROTECTION GOALS
- X December : Teleconference RECOVERY
- 5 January (14.00 -18.00 CET) + 6 January (9.00-13.00 CET) 2015 RECOVERY- SC ERA WG meeting, Parma
- 6 January (14.00 -18.00 CET) + 7 January (9.00-13.00 CET) 2015 ENDANGERED SPECIES - SC ERA WG meeting, Parma
- 7 January (14.00 -18.00 CET) + 8 January (9.00-13.00 CET) 2015 PROTECTION GOALS- SC ERA WG meeting, Parma
- 23 February (13.30 -17.30 CET) + 24 February (9.00-13.00 CET) 2015: ENDANGERED SPECIES - SC ERA WG meeting, Parma.

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁵ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/scerwgs/documents/era_overarching.pdf

Scientific Committee and Emerging Risks (SCER) UNIT

Scientific Committee

Minutes of the 17th meeting of the Working Group on overarching elements of environmental risk assessment

Held by WEB/TELE-conference, on 17 October 2014

(Agreed on 3 November 2014)

Participants

- **Working Group Members**
 - Chris Hogstrand
 - Theo Brock, Geoff Frampton, Fabrice Martin-Laurent, Chris Topping, Wopke Vander Werf via WEB/TELE-conference
- **Hearing Experts¹:**
 - Not Applicable
- **European Commission and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Not Applicable
- **EFSA:**
 - ALPHA Unit: Sybren Vos
 - SCER Unit: Agnes Rortais
- **Others**
 - Not Applicable

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Robert Luttik.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ As defined in Article 17 of the Decision of the Executive Director on the selection of external experts:
<http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/expertselection.pdf>.

3. Declarations of Interest of Working Groups members

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director on Declarations of Interest³, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of Interest filled in by the working group member invited for the present meeting. No Conflicts of Interest related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 16th Working Group WEB/TELE-conference meeting held on 13 October 2014.

The minutes of the of the 16th Working Group meeting held on 13 October 2014 were agreed.⁴

5. Scientific topic for discussion

5.1 Recovery ([EFSA-Q-2013-00902](http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2013-00902))

<http://registerofquestions.efsa.europa.eu/roqFrontend/questionLoader?question=EFSA-Q-2013-00902>

The working group members reviewed comments and approved new text on version 9. In particular, chapters 1, 2, 3, 5 and 7. Christer Hogstrand provided detailed information on the environmental risk assessment of feed additives and agreed with the members of the working group to further expand some sections of chapter 5 on feed additives for the next Recovery working group meeting scheduled for 20-21 November. Actions points for the next meeting were defined. In particular, the working group was requested to address the last comments made on the above revised chapters and to review the new chapter 8 on the conceptual framework and propose new alternatives. Chapters 6 and 8 will be addressed at the next meeting in November. The meeting place for the next meeting was discussed (EFSA instead of Amsterdam) and was confirmed to the WG on 20 October and a new possible meeting date for the next WEB/TELE-conference, tentatively planned on 5th December, will be re-scheduled in the second or third week of December with a doodle poll.

6. Any Other Business

6.1 Not Applicable

7. Next meetings

- 3 November (13.30 -17.30 CET) + 4 November (9.00-13.00 CET) 2014: ENDANGERED SPECIES - SC ERA WG meeting, Parma
- 13 November (14.00 -18.00 CET) + 14 November (9.00-13.30 CET) 2014: PROTECTION GOALS- SC ERA WG meeting, Parma
- 20 November (14.00 -18.00 CET) + 21 November (9.00-13.00 CET) 2014: RECOVERY - SC ERA WG meeting, Parma
- 5 December (9.30-13.00 + 14-17.30): Teleconference ENDANGERED SPECIES

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules2014.pdf>

⁴ http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/scerwgs/documents/era_overarching.pdf

- 10 December: Teleconference PROTECTION GOALS
- X December : Teleconference RECOVERY
- 5 January (14.00 -18.00 CET) + 6 January (9.00-13.00 CET) 2015 RECOVERY- SC ERA WG meeting, Parma
- 6 January (14.00 -18.00 CET) + 7 January (9.00-13.00 CET) 2015 ENDANGERED SPECIES - SC ERA WG meeting, Parma
- 7 January (14.00 -18.00 CET) + 8 January (9.00-13.00 CET) 2015 PROTECTION GOALS- SC ERA WG meeting, Parma
- 23 February (13.30 -17.30 CET) + 24 February (9.00-13.00 CET) 2015: ENDANGERED SPECIES - SC ERA WG meeting, Parma.

Scientific Committee and Emerging Risks UNIT

Scientific Committee

Minutes of the 16th meeting of the Working Group on overarching elements of environmental risk assessment

Webconference held on 13 October 2014, Parma

(Agreed on 17 October 2014)

Participants

- **Working Groups Experts:**
 - Robert Luttik, Tony Hardy, Theo Brock, Joerg Romeis, Wopke Vander Werf, Christer Hogstrand have participated via webconference
- **Hearing Experts:**
 - none
- **European Commission, EU agencies and/or Member States representatives:**
 - none
- **EFSA:**
 - SCER Unit: Reinhilde Schoonjans and Angelo Maggiore
 - GMO Unit: Yann Devos
 - PRAS Unit: Franz Streissl (via webconference)

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair, Robert Luttik, welcomed the participants. Apologies were received from the working group member Joe Perry.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest and the Specific Declaration of interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 15th Working Group Telemeeting held on 9 and 10 October 2014, Parma/webconference.

The minutes were agreed without changes.

5. Scientific topics for discussion

5.1 Protection Goals ([EFSA-Q-2013-00289](#))

The working group members discussed what is the relevant information related to the three successive steps of the process of operationalisation of protection goals: identification of relevant ecosystem services, identification of service providing units, specification of the level and parameters of protection using six dimensions.

The members agreed to draft criteria for the selection of the most appropriate option for each dimension, to finalise the section on interrelationships between biodiversity and ecosystem services, delete some parts of the appendix and summarise the links between the assessment endpoint level and the other parts of the problem formulation by the beginning of november. The next WG meeting is planned for mid-november and will focus on the discussion of these criteria and the new version of the opinion.

6. Any Other Business

-

7. Next meeting(s)

- 17 October (14.00-18.00 CET): RECOVERY – SC ERA WG meeting, teleconference
- 3 November (13.30 -17.30 CET) + 4 November (9.00-13.00 CET) 2014: ENDANGERED SPECIES - SC ERA WG meeting, Parma
- 20 November (14.00 -18.00 CET) + 21 November (9.00-13.00 CET) 2014: RECOVERY - SC ERA WG meeting, Amsterdam or EFSA (TBC)
- 5 December: Teleconference(s) for all
- 5 January (14.00 -18.00 CET) + 6 January (9.00-13.00 CET) 2015 RECOVERY- SC ERA WG meeting, Parma
- 6 January (14.00 -18.00 CET) + 7 January (9.00-13.00 CET) 2015 ENDANGERED SPECIES - SC ERA WG meeting, Parma
- End Feb – beginning March 2015: ENDANGERED SPECIES - SC ERA WG, Parma

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

Scientific Committee and Emerging Risks UNIT

Scientific Committee

Minutes of the 15th meeting of the Working Group on overarching elements of environmental risk assessment

Webconference held on 9-10 October 2014, Parma

(Agreed on 13 October 2014)

Participants

- **Working Groups Experts:**
 - Robert Luttik, Theo Brock
 - Michael Bonsall¹, Mira Kattwinkel, Ad Ragas, Paulo Sousa, Claus Svendsen, Jonathan Jeschke¹ and Gianni Gilioli have participated via webconference
- **Hearing Experts:**
 - none
- **European Commission, EU agencies and/or Member States representatives:**
 - none
- **EFSA:**
 - SCER Unit: Reinhilde Schoonjans
 - GMO Unit: Fernando Alvarez

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair, Robert Luttik, welcomed the participants. Gianni Gilioli joined the WG as nominated PLH Panel expert.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ on the first day only

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests³, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest and the Specific Declaration of interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 14th Working Group Telemeeting held on 4 and 5 continued on 15 September 2014, Parma/webconference.

The minutes were agreed without changes.

5. Scientific topics for discussion

5.1 Endangered Species ([EFSA-Q-2013-00901](#))

The new structure of the draft opinion was endorsed to present the information relevant for the assessment of the risks for endangered species caused by regulated stressors to the food/feed chain. The experts provided updates on all sections of the draft opinion and outstanding comments were addressed with the group. For sections under development, a clear outline and timeline were agreed by next meeting that will take place on 3-4 November.

6. Any Other Business

6.1 Documentation: Working group members can share relevant background information in the future through OpenText (instead of Sciencenet).

6.2 The timeline for finalisation of the opinion was discussed in view of the SC plenary meetings in 2015 and the consultations to be held.

7. Next meeting(s)

- 13 October (14.00 -18.00 CET) 2014: PROTECTION GOALS - SC ERA WG, teleconference
- 17 October (14.00-18.00 CET): RECOVERY – SC ERA WG meeting, teleconference
- 3 November (13.30 -17.30 CET) + 4 November (9.00-13.00 CET) 2014: ENDANGERED SPECIES - SC ERA WG meeting, Parma
- 20 November (14.00 -18.00 CET) + 21 November (9.00-13.00 CET) 2014: RECOVERY - SC ERA WG meeting, Amsterdam or EFSA (TBC)
- 5 December: Teleconference(s) for all
- 5 January (14.00 -18.00 CET) + 6 January (9.00-13.00 CET) 2015 RECOVERY- SC ERA WG meeting, Parma
- 6 January (14.00 -18.00 CET) + 7 January (9.00-13.00 CET) 2015 ENDANGERED SPECIES - SC ERA WG meeting, Parma
- End Feb – beginning March 2015: ENDANGERED SPECIES - SC ERA WG, Parma

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

Scientific Committee and Emerging Risks UNIT

Scientific Committee

Minutes of the 14th meeting of the Working Group on overarching elements of environmental risk assessment

Webconference held on 4-5 September 2014, Parma

(Agreed on 9 October 2014)

Participants

- **Working Groups Experts:**

- Joerg Romeis, Robert Luttik, Michael Bonsall, Mira Kattwinkel, Ad Ragas, Paulo Sousa, Claus Svendsen, Franz Bigler, Theo Brock, Geoff Frampton, Fabrice Martin-Laurent, Chris Topping
- Joe Perry and Jonathan Jeschke have participated via webconference
- Anthony Hardy has participated via webconference on the second day

- **Hearing Experts:**

- none

- **European Commission, EU agencies and/or Member States representatives:**

- none

- **EFSA:**

- SCER Unit: Reinhilde Schoonjans, Agnes Rortais, Angelo Maggiore, Jean-Lou Dorne
- PRAS Unit: José Tarazona, Franz Streissl
- GMO Unit: Yann Devos

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair, Robert Luttik, welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from the working group members Christer Hogstrand, Wopke Van der Werf, from the EFSA staff Sybren Vos (ALPHA Unit) and from all observers to the WG.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

Page 1 of 4

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest and the Specific Declaration of interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 13th Working Group Telemeeting held on 11 and continued on 29 July 2014, Parma.

The minutes were agreed without changes.

5. Scientific topics for discussion

The experts worked in break-out meetings on the 4th of September and had a joint session on the 5th to report back and discuss matters of general interest.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

5.1 Protection Goals ([EFSA-Q-2013-00289](#))

The working group members started discussing outstanding issues, amendments and comments related with the core sections of the opinion. Then the discussion focused on restructuring, particularly the possibility of concentrating on the assessment endpoint level of the problem formulation and move the other parts to the Annexes. The members proposed to use the six dimensions for each ecosystem service/key driver combination as assessment endpoints and to summarise the links with the other parts of the problem formulation, analysis and risk management phase. Moreover the members proposed to draft criteria for the selection of the most appropriate option for each dimension. Given the impact of this proposal, it was discussed with the whole group on 5 September where it was decided to elaborate the proposal. This discussion continued on per teleconference on 15 September. The next WG meeting will focus on the discussion of these criteria and on the new structure of the opinion.

5.2 Recovery ([EFSA-Q-2013-00902](#))

The working group members have thoroughly revised the first three sections of the scientific opinion (i.e. 1. Introduction, 2. Ecological recovery in the prospective environmental risk assessment for regulated stressors and 3. Pulse and press disturbance and ecological recovery and clarification on terminology). The members have discussed in good details the conceptual framework for the assessment of ecological recovery in prospective ERAs for regulated products. This framework was further elaborated and presented to the whole ERA WG on 5 September for discussion. New actions were identified for each member for the revision and implementation of sections 5 to 9 to be partly covered by 17 October (section 5-8) and 20-21 November (section 9).

5.3 Endangered Species ([EFSA-Q-2013-00901](#))

The experts have collected information relevant for the assessment of the risks for endangered species caused by regulated stressors to the food/feed chain. This process will continue by including further Panel specific information. As intermediate conclusions are being considered, a restructuring of the document was suggested to better rankorder and frame the key issues. The positioning of the present parts and how they should be reworked was discussed. EFSA staff will prepare the updated document and circulated the task distribution for delivery by the next teleconference on 9-10 October. Given the impact of these changes, an extra meeting has been scheduled for 3-4 November.

5.4 Joint session on all 3 questions

The timeline for the finalisation of the mandate was discussed. In order to organise the Panel, Agency and Public Consultations in a consecutive manner, the envisaged deadline would be December 2015. The Scientific Committee will be informed and asked for agreement on its Plenary meeting of 16-17 September. Extra delegation from the PLH panel was considered in order to meet the tasks newly formulated during this meeting.

6. Any Other Business

6.1 Documentation

Working group members can share relevant background information through sciencenet.

7. Next meeting(s)

- 9 October (13.30 -17.30 CET) + 10 October (9.00-13.00 CET) 2014: ENDANGERED SPECIES - SC ERA WG teleconference
- 13 October (14.00 -18.00 CET) 2014: PROTECTION GOALS - SC ERA WG, teleconference
- 17 October (14.00-18.00 CET): RECOVERY – SC ERA WG meeting, teleconference
- 3 November (13.30 -17.30 CET) + 4 November (9.00-13.00 CET) 2014: ENDANGERED SPECIES - SC ERA WG meeting, Parma
- 20 November (14.00 -18.00 CET) + 21 November (9.00-13.00 CET) 2014: RECOVERY - SC ERA WG meeting, Amsterdam or EFSA (TBC)
- 5 December: Teleconference(s) for all
- 5 January (14.00 -18.00 CET) + 6 January (9.00-13.00 CET) 2015 RECOVERY- SC ERA WG meeting, Parma
- 6 January (14.00 -18.00 CET) + 7 January (9.00-13.00 CET) 2015 ENDANGERED SPECIES - SC ERA WG meeting, Parma

Scientific Committee and Emerging Risks UNIT

Scientific Committee

Minutes of the 13th meeting of the Working Group on overarching elements of environmental risk assessment

Teleconferences held on 11 July 2014, Parma

(Agreed on 4 September 2014)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - am: Theo Brock, Tony Hardy, Christer Hogstrand, Robert Luttik, Jörg Romeis, Wopke Van der Werf
 - pm: Michael Bonsall, Theo Brock, Jonathan Jeschke, Robert Luttik, Ad Ragas
- **Hearing Experts:**
 - none
- **European Commission, EU agencies and/or Member States representatives:**
 - none
- **EFSA:**
 - SCER Unit: Angelo Maggiore, Jean-Lou Dorne, Reinhilde Schoonjans

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair, Robert Luttik, welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from the working group members Joe Perry, Mira Kattwinkel, Paulo Sousa and Claus Svendsen as well as from the EFSA staff Franz Streissl and José Tarazona (pesticides Unit), Yann Devos (GMO Unit), Sara Tramontini (PLH Unit) and Agnes Rortais (SCER Unit).

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest and the Specific Declaration of interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 12th Working Group Telemeeting held on 7 July 2014, Parma.

The minutes were agreed without changes.

5. Scientific topics for discussion

5.1 Protection Goals ([EFSA-Q-2013-00289](#))

The working group members discussed and approved most of the restructuring and amendments made in the scientific opinion. Outstanding issues and further suggestions for restructuring were discussed, particularly the possibility to regroup panel-specific information from the chapters on the options for dimensions and the examples of problem formulation. Specific questions, especially in the chapter on ecosystem services and the dimensions, will be addressed during a dedicated meeting on 29 July as a continuation of this meeting. The current draft chapters on problem formulation, adversity, harm, mitigation and PMEM were discussed. Key scientific papers that have recently been published were discussed for their relevance to the current opinion.

5.1 Endangered species ([EFSA-Q-2013-00901](#))

New contributions were received before the meeting and the working group members discussed and approved most of the new amendments made. All chapters were revisited and commented for further development. Now contributions, including an outline for restructuring, will be invited by end August to prepare an update of the scientific opinion for the next meeting on 4-5 September.

6. Any Other Business

6.1 Documentation

Working group members can share relevant background information through sciencenet.

7. Next meeting(s)

- August: none
- 4 September (9.00 -17.30 CET) + 5 September (9.00-13.00 CET) 2014: RECOVERY + ENDANGERED SPECIES + STEERING - SC ERA WG meeting, Parma

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

- 9 October (13.30 -17.30 CET) + 10 October (9.00-13.00 CET) 2014: ENDANGERED SPECIES - SC ERA WG teleconference
- 17 October (14.00-18.00 CET): RECOVERY – SC ERA WG meeting, Parma (tbc)
- 3 November (13.30 -17.30 CET) + 4 November (9.00-13.00 CET) 2014: ENDANGERED SPECIES - SC ERA WG meeting, Parma
- 20 November (14.00 -18.00 CET) + 21 November (9.00-13.00 CET) 2014: RECOVERY - SC ERA WG meeting, Amsterdam
- 5 December: Teleconference(s) for all
- 5 January (14.00 -18.00 CET) + 6 January (9.00-13.00 CET) 2015 for RECOVERY- SC ERA WG meeting
- 6 January (14.00 -18.00 CET) + 7 January (9.00-13.00 CET) 2015 for ENDANGERED SPECIES - SC ERA WG meeting

Scientific Committee and Emerging Risks UNIT

Scientific Committee

Minutes of the 12th meeting of the Working Group on overarching elements of environmental risk assessment

Teleconference held on 7 July 2014, Parma

(Agreed on 11 July 2014)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Theo Brock, Robert Luttik, Fabrice Martin-Laurent, Chris Topping and Wopke Van der Werf
- **Hearing Experts:**
 - none
- **European Commission, EU agencies and/or Member States representatives:**
 - none
- **EFSA:**
 - SCER Unit: Angelo Maggiore, Agnes Rortais, Reinhilde Schoonjans
 - PRAS Unit: Franz Streissl

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair, Theo Brock, welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from the working group members Franz Bigler and Geoff Frampton.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

Declarations of Interests², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest and the Specific Declaration of interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 11th Working Group Telemeeting held on 12th June 2014, Parma.

The minutes were agreed without changes.

5. Scientific topics for discussion

5.1 Recovery ([EFSA-Q-2013-00902](#))

The working group members discussed and approved most of the new amendments made in the first 6 chapters of the Scientific Opinion. The working group members discussed the structure of the scientific opinion, particularly the content of chapter 7 on functional recovery and ecosystem resilience and the status of chapter 8 on the usefulness of modelling approaches to address ecological recovery. New action points were identified for the next meeting in September 2014. The September meeting will focus on updating Chapter 5 (Properties of regulated stressors and how ecological recovery is addressed) and discussing a conceptual framework to address ecological recovery in prospective ERA.

6. Any Other Business

6.1 Documentation

Working group members can share relevant background information through sciencenet.

7. Next meeting(s)

- 11 July: Teleconference(s) for STEERING and ENDANGERED SPECIES - SC ERA
- August: none
- 4 September (9.00 -17.30 CET) + 5 September (9.00-13.00 CET) 2014: RECOVERY + ENDANGERED SPECIES + STEERING - SC ERA WG meeting, Parma
- 9 October (13.30 -17.30 CET) + 10 October (9.00-13.00 CET) 2014: ENDANGERED SPECIES - SC ERA WG meeting, Parma
- 17 October (14.00-18.00 CET): RECOVERY – SC ERA WG meeting, Parma (tbc)
- 20 November (14.00 -18.00 CET) + 21 November (9.00-13.00 CET) 2014: RECOVERY - SC ERA WG meeting, Amsterdam
- 5 December: Teleconference(s) for all
- 5 January (14.00 -18.00 CET) + 6 January (9.00-13.00 CET) 2015 for RECOVERY- SC ERA WG meeting and 6 January (14.00 -18.00 CET) + 7 January (9.00-13.00 CET) 2015 for ENDANGERED SPECIES - SC ERA WG meeting

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

Scientific Committee and Emerging Risks UNIT

Scientific Committee

Minutes of the 11th meeting of the Working Group on overarching elements of environmental risk assessment

Teleconference held on 13 June and continued on 20 June 2014, Parma

(Agreed on 7 July 2014)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Robert Luttik, Theo Brock, Joe Perry, Wopke Van der Werf, Tony Hardy
- **Hearing Experts:**
 - none
- **European Commission, EU agencies and/or Member States representatives:**
 - none
- **EFSA:**
 - SCER Unit: Reinhilde Schoonjans
 - GMO Unit: Yann Devos

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair, Robert Luttik, welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from the working group member Christer Hogstrand and Jörg Romeis. Apologies were also received from the EFSA staff Franz Streissl and José Tarazona (PPR Unit), and Sara Tramontini (ALPHA Unit).

Due to technical disruptions of telecom services, the meeting was continued on Friday 20 June 2014 with the same participants.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest and the Specific Declaration of interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 10th Working Group Telemeeting held on 5-6 June 2014, Parma.

The minutes were agreed without changes.

5. Scientific topics for discussion

5.1 Protection Goals ([EFSA-Q-2013-00289](#))

The working group members discussed the updates on all the sections of the draft opinion and key points for further clarification were identified. The current task division is kept and working group members were asked to prepare next updates for the teleconference of 13 July.

6. Any Other Business

6.1 Documentation

Working group members can share relevant background information through sciencenet.

7. Next meeting(s)

- 7 July: Teleconference RECOVERY - SC ERA WG (14.00 -18.00 CET).
- 11 July: Teleconference(s) for STEERING and ENDANGERED SPECIES - SC ERA
- August: none
- 4 September (9.00 -17.30 CET) + 5 September (9.00-13.00 CET) 2014: RECOVERY + ENDANGERED SPECIES + STEERING - SC ERA WG meeting, Parma
- 9 October (13.30 -17.30 CET) + 10 October (9.00-13.00 CET) 2014: ENDANGERED SPECIES - SC ERA WG meeting, Parma
- 17 October (14.00-18.00 CET): RECOVERY – SC ERA WG meeting, Parma (tbc)
- 20 November (14.00 -18.00 CET) + 21 November (9.00-13.00 CET) 2014: RECOVERY - SC ERA WG meeting, Amsterdam
- 5 December: Teleconference(s) for all
- 5 January (14.00 -18.00 CET) + 6 January (9.00-13.00 CET) 2015 for RECOVERY- SC ERA WG meeting and 6 January (14.00 -18.00 CET) + 7 January (9.00-13.00 CET) 2015 for ENDANGERED SPECIES - SC ERA WG meeting

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

Scientific Committee and Emerging Risks UNIT

Scientific Committee

Minutes of the 10th meeting of the Working Group on overarching elements of environmental risk assessment

Held on 5-6 June 2014, Parma

(Agreed on 13 June 2014)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Franz Bigler, Theo Brock, Robert Luttik, Fabrice Martin-Laurent, Geoff Frampton, Wopke Van der Werf and Chris Topping
- **Hearing Experts:**
 - none
- **European Commission, EU agencies and/or Member States representatives:**
 - none
- **EFSA:**
 - SCER Unit: Agnes Rortais and Reinhilde Schoonjans
 - PPR Unit: Franz Streissl (5 June)
 - ALPHA: Sara Tramontini

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair, Theo Brock, welcomed the participants and the new expert Fabrice Martin-Laurent.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest and the Specific Declaration of interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 9th Working Group meeting held on 22-23 05 2014, Parma.

The minutes were agreed without changes.

5. Scientific topics for discussion

5.1 Recovery ([EFSA-Q-2013-00902](#))

Members of the WG had an open exchange of views on the amendments made to the scientific opinion on temporal and spatial recovery of non-target organisms for environmental risk assessments. New tasks were assigned to WG members for the implementation the discussed sections and will be presented at WG 13. The WG had also an open exchange of views on the terms of a conceptual and methodological framework for addressing ecological recovery. A framework was proposed and will be re-discussed in more depth at WG 14.

6. Any Other Business

6.1. Documentation

Working group members can share relevant background information through sciencenet.

6.2. New meeting date

A provisional and additional TC meeting was scheduled for the WG on Recovery on 17 October 2014 (14.00-18.00 CET) and needs to be confirmed.

7. Next meeting(s)

- 13 June (9.30-13.00CET): Teleconference for STEERING - SC ERA WG
- 7 July: Teleconference RECOVERY - SC ERA WG (14.00 -18.00 CET).
- 11 July: Teleconference(s) for STEERING - SC ERA WG and ENDANGERED SPECIES - SC ERA WG meeting
- August: none
- 4 September (13.30 -17.30 CET) + 5 September (9.00-13.00 CET) 2014: STEERING - SC ERA WG meeting, Parma
- 9 October (13.30 -17.30 CET) + 10 October (9.00-13.00 CET) 2014: ENDANGERED SPECIES - SC ERA WG meeting, Parma
- 17 October (14.00-18.00 CET): RECOVERY – SC ERA WG meeting, Parma (tbc)

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

- 20 November (14.00 -18.00 CET) + 21 November (9.00-13.00 CET) 2014: RECOVERY - SC ERA WG meeting, Amsterdam
- 5 December: Teleconference(s) for all
- 5 January (14.00 -18.00 CET) + 6 January (9.00-13.00 CET) 2015 for RECOVERY-SC ERA WG meeting and 6 January (14.00 -18.00 CET) + 7 January (9.00-13.00 CET) 2015 for ENDANGERED SPECIES - SC ERA WG meeting (tbc)

Scientific Committee and Emerging Risks UNIT

Scientific Committee

Minutes of the 9th meeting of the Working Group on overarching elements of environmental risk assessment

Held on 22-23 May 2014, Parma

(Agreed on 5 June 2014)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Michael Bonsall, Theo Brock, Robert Luttik, Ad Ragas, Claus Svendsen¹, Mira Kattwinkel, Jonathan Jeschke
- **Hearing Experts:**
 - none
- **European Commission, EU agencies and/or Member States representatives:**
 - none
- **EFSA:**
 - SCER Unit: Reinhilde Schoonjans

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair, Robert Luttik, welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from the working group member Paulo Sousa. Apologies were also received from the EFSA staff Yann Devos (GMO Unit), Franz Streissl and José Tarazona (PPR Unit), and Sara Tramontini (ALPHA Unit).

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

¹ Online conference on 22 and 23 May

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests³, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest and the Specific Declaration of interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 8th Working Group telemeeting held on 16 May 2014, Parma.

The minutes were agreed without changes.

5. Scientific topics for discussion

5.1 Endangered Species ([EFSA-Q-2013-00901](#))

The working group members presented their updated sections of the draft opinion. The key topics asked for under the terms of reference are addressed in the outline opinion and were discussed in greater detail. It was suggested to revisit the structure, the subtitles and to merge items together as their linkage was more clarified. An open exchange of views took place on the specification of protection goals for endangered species and the problem formulation to cover endangered species in ERA schemes for regulated products/invasive species. Further discussions are needed.

6. Any Other Business

6.1 Documentation

Working group members can share relevant background information through sciencenet.

7. Next meeting(s)

- 5 June (13.30 -17.30 CET) + 6 June (9.00-13.00 CET) 2014: RECOVERY - SC ERA WG meeting, Parma.
- 13 June (9.30-13.00 CET): Teleconference for STEERING - SC ERA WG
- 7 July: Teleconference RECOVERY - SC ERA WG (14.00 -18.00 CET)
- 11 July: (9.30-13.00 CET) Teleconference for STEERING - SC ERA WG and (13.00-17.00 CET) Teleconference for ENDANGERED SPECIES - SC ERA WG meeting
- August: none
- 4 September (13.30 -17.30 CET) + 5 September (9.00-13.00 CET) 2014: STEERING - SC ERA WG meeting, Parma (tbc)
- 9 October (13.30 -17.30 CET) + 10 October (9.00-13.00 CET) 2014: ENDANGERED SPECIES - SC ERA WG meeting, Parma

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

- 20 November (13.30 -17.30 CET) + 21 November (9.00-13.00 CET) 2014: RECOVERY - SC ERA WG meeting, Amsterdam
- 5 December: Teleconference(s) for all
- 5 January (14.00 -18.00 CET) + 6 January (9.00-13.00 CET) 2015 for RECOVERY- SC ERA WG meeting and 6 January (14.00 -18.00 CET) + 7 January (9.00-13.00 CET) 2015 for ENDANGERED SPECIES - SC ERA WG meeting (tbc)

Scientific Committee and Emerging Risks UNIT

Scientific Committee

Minutes of the 8th meeting of the Working Group on overarching elements of environmental risk assessment - RECOVERY

WEB/TELE-conference, 16 May 2014, 13-17h (CET)

(agreed on 22 May 2014)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Franz Bigler, Theo Brock, Geoff Frampton (until 16h00), Robert Luttik, Wopke Van der Werf and Chris Topping
- **Hearing Experts:**
 - none
- **European Commission, EU agencies and/or Member States representatives:**
 - none
- **EFSA:**
 - SCER Unit: Agnes Rortais
 - PRAS Unit : Franz Streissl

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair, Theo Brock, welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from Reinhilde Schoonjans.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest and the Specific Declaration of interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 7th Working Group Tele/web meeting held on 11 May 2014, Parma.

The minutes were agreed with no changes.

5. Scientific topics for discussion

5.1 Recovery ([EFSA-Q-2013-00902](#))

Members of the WG who contributed to the drafting of some sections of the first draft opinion presented their input and an open exchange of views followed on the following items : recovery and protection goals; terminology associated with pulse and press disturbance and ecological recovery including population recovery and ecosystem resilience; specific features for agro-ecosystems including landscape components; properties and spatial-temporal exposures of regulated products in the context of species recovery; species traits; landscape and ecosystem properties affecting species recovery; and pros and cons from experimental and modelling approaches to address recovery. The WG agreed to have a new section on functional recovery including ecosystem resilience aspects and another section on the development of a conceptual framework for addressing recovery for regulated products. New tasks were assigned to WG members for the implementation and drafting of the discussed section. These amendments and the new section on the conceptual framework will be discussed in depth at the next meeting.

6. Any Other Business

6.1 Documentation

Working group members can share relevant background information through sciencenet.

7. Next meeting(s)

- 22 May (13.30 -17.30 CET) + 23 May (9.00-13.00 CET) 2014: ENDANGERED SPECIES - SC ERA WG meeting, Parma
- 5 June (13.30 -17.30 CET) + 6 June (9.00-13.00 CET) 2014: RECOVERY - SC ERA WG meeting, Parma.
- 13 June (9.30-13.00CET): Teleconference for STEERING - SC ERA WG
- 7 July: Teleconference RECOVERY - SC ERA WG (14.00 -18.00 CET)
- 11 July: Teleconference(s) for STEERING - SC ERA WG and ENDANGERED SPECIES - SC ERA WG meeting (tbc)

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

- August: none
- 4 September (13.30 -17.30 CET) + 5 September (9.00-13.00 CET) 2014: STEERING - SC ERA WG meeting, Parma (tbc)
- 9 October (13.30 -17.30 CET) + 10 October (9.00-13.00 CET) 2014: ENDANGERED SPECIES - SC ERA WG meeting, Parma
- 20 November (13.30 -17.30 CET) + 21 November (9.00-13.00 CET) 2014: RECOVERY - SC ERA WG meeting, Amsterdam
- 5 December: Teleconference(s) for all
- 5 January (14.00 -18.00 CET) + 6 January (9.00-13.00 CET) 2015 for RECOVERY- SC ERA WG meeting and 6 January (14.00 -18.00 CET) + 7 January (9.00-13.00 CET) 2015 for ENDANGERED SPECIES - SC ERA WG meeting (tbc)

Scientific Committee and Emerging Risks UNIT

Scientific Committee

Minutes of the 7th meeting of the Working Group on overarching elements of environmental risk assessment

WEB/TELE-conference, 11 April 2014

(agreed on 16 May 2014)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - am: Theo Brock, Tony Hardy, Robert Luttik, Joe Perry, Jörg Romeis, Wopke Van der Werf
 - pm: Michael Bonsall, Theo Brock, Robert Luttik, Ad Ragas, Claus Svendsen, Mira Kattwinkel, Jonathan Jeschke
- **Hearing Experts:**
 - none
- **European Commission, EU agencies and/or Member States representatives:**
 - none
- **EFSA:**
 - SCER Unit: Reinhilde Schoonjans

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair, Robert Luttik, welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from the working group members of the steering group Christer Hogstrand and on endangered species Paulo Sousa. Apologies were also received from the EFSA staff Yann Devos (GMO Unit), Franz Streissl and José Tarazona (PPR Unit), and Sara Tramontini (ALPHA Unit).

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

Page 1 of 3

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest and the Specific Declaration of interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 6th Working Group meeting held on 13-14 March 2014, Parma.

The minutes were agreed with minor editorial changes.

5. Scientific topics for discussion

5.1 Protection Goals ([EFSA-Q-2013-00289](#))

In the morning session, the working group members of the steering group addressed the main topics for the draft opinion on protection goals. The outline and illustrations for the opinion were prepared by EFSA staff and were based on the 19th EFSA Colloquium³ outcome, prior discussions in the WG and current practices in EFSA ERA schemes. This outline was now endorsed and while discussing the content of the various sections, the WG further distributed the tasks. Selected topics, such as the spatial scale of specific protection goal, will merit dedicated discussion time. The spatial scale of specific protection goals is often expressed as in-field or off-field. The diverse definitions of these terms as currently in use by different parties were compiled with the aim to find a harmonize set of definitions for the purposes of EFSA ERA schemes. One extra teleconference will be held on 13 June.

5.2 Endangered Species ([EFSA-Q-2013-00901](#))

The first draft of the opinion was tabled and further elaborated during the afternoon session of the meeting. The working group members for endangered species further addressed the main topics on hazard assessment, exposure assessment and risk equation. Exploring possible scientific approaches to cover endangered species in ERA schemes for regulated products/invasive species, an open exchange of views took place. In the absence of toxicity data, it was explored in how far historical data and surrogate species can be used. Further discussions are needed.

6. Any Other Business

6.1 Documentation

Working group members can share relevant background information through sciencenet.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

³ the Summary Report of EFSA's Colloquium XIX on "Biodiversity as Protection Goal in Environmental Risk Assessment for EU agro-ecosystems" is published at: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/supporting/pub/583e.htm>

7. Next meeting(s)

- 16 May: teleconference RECOVERY - SC ERA WG (14.00 -18.00 CET)
- 22 May (13.30 -17.30 CET) + 23 May (9.00-13.00 CET) 2014: ENDANGERED SPECIES - SC ERA WG meeting, Parma
- 5 June (13.30 -17.30 CET) + 6 June (9.00-13.00 CET) 2014: RECOVERY - SC ERA WG meeting, Parma.
- 13 June (9.30-13.00CET): Teleconference for STEERING - SC ERA WG
- 7 July: Teleconference RECOVERY - SC ERA WG (14.00 -18.00 CET)
- 11 July: Teleconference(s) for STEERING - SC ERA WG and ENDANGERED SPECIES - SC ERA WG meeting (tbc)
- August: none
- 4 September (13.30 -17.30 CET) + 5 September (9.00-13.00 CET) 2014: STEERING - SC ERA WG meeting, Parma (tbc)
- 9 October (13.30 -17.30 CET) + 10 October (9.00-13.00 CET) 2014: ENDANGERED SPECIES - SC ERA WG meeting, Parma
- 20 November (13.30 -17.30 CET) + 21 November (9.00-13.00 CET) 2014: RECOVERY - SC ERA WG meeting, Amsterdam
- 5 December: Teleconference(s) for all
- 5 January (14.00 -18.00 CET) + 6 January (9.00-13.00 CET) 2015 for RECOVERY- SC ERA WG meeting and 6 January (14.00 -18.00 CET) + 7 January (9.00-13.00 CET) 2015 for ENDANGERED SPECIES - SC ERA WG meeting (tbc)

Scientific Committee

Minutes of the 6th meeting of the Working Group on overarching elements of environmental risk assessment

Held on 13-14 March 2014, Parma

(agreed on 11 April 2014)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Franz Bigler, Theo Brock, Robert Luttik, Wopke Van der Werf and Chris Topping¹
- **Hearing Experts:**
 - none
- **European Commission, EU agencies and/or Member States representatives:**
 - none
- **EFSA:**
 - SCER Unit: Agnes Rortais, Reinhilde Schoonjans

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair, Theo Brock, welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from the working group member on Recovery Geoff Frampton.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding

¹ Online conference on 13 and 14 March

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

Declarations of Interests³, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest and the Specific Declaration of interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 5th Working Group meeting held on 6-7 02 2014, Parma.

The minutes were agreed without changes.

5. Scientific topics for discussion

5.1 Recovery ([EFSA-Q-2013-00902](#))

The working group addressed the main topics for the draft opinion during its scientific discussions on terminology, properties of regulated products/invasive species and spatial-temporal aspects of their exposure in agro-ecosystems, species traits, landscape and ecosystem properties affecting species recovery and experimental and modelling approaches to address recovery. An open exchange of views took place on possible ways to cover recovery in ERA schemes for regulated products/invasive species. Material relevant for this draft opinion was circulated and discussed. The structure of the opinion was defined and tasks among members were assigned for the drafting of the agreed sections. A first draft is foreseen for the next meeting.

6. Any Other Business

6.1. Documentation

Working group members can share relevant background information through sciencenet.

6.2. Expertise in microbiology

The chair and the members of the working group on recovery identified missing expertise within the working group in the field of microbiology. EFSA will investigate the possibility of inviting an additional expert with this requested expertise.

7. Next meetings

- 11 April: Teleconference protection goals am, teleconference ENDANGERED SPECIES - SC ERA WG pm.
- 16 May: teleconference RECOVERY - SC ERA WG (14.00 -18.00 CET).
- 22 May (13.30 -17.30 CET) + 23 May (9.00-13.00 CET) 2014: ENDANGERED SPECIES - SC ERA WG meeting, Parma
- 5 June (14.00 -18.00 CET) + 6 June (9.00-13.00 CET) 2014: RECOVERY - SC ERA WG meeting, Parma.
- 7 July: Teleconference RECOVERY - SC ERA WG (14.00 -18.00 CET).
- 11 July: Teleconference(s) for STEERING - SC ERA WG and ENDANGERED SPECIES - SC ERA WG meeting (tbc)
- August: none

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

- 4 September (13.30 -17.30 CET) + 5 September (9.00-13.00 CET) 2014: STEERING - SC ERA WG meeting, Parma (tbc)
- 9 October (13.30 -17.30 CET) + 10 October (9.00-13.00 CET) 2014: ENDANGERED SPECIES - SC ERA WG meeting, Parma
- 20 November (14.00 -18.00 CET) + 21 November (9.00-13.00 CET) 2014: RECOVERY - SC ERA WG meeting, Amsterdam
- 5 December: Teleconference(s) for all
- 5 January (14.00 -18.00 CET) + 6 January (9.00-13.00 CET) 2015 for RECOVERY- SC ERA WG meeting and 6 January (14.00 -18.00 CET) + 7 January (9.00-13.00 CET) 2015 for ENDANGERED SPECIES - SC ERA WG meeting (tbc)

Scientific Committee

Minutes of the 5th meeting of the Working Group on overarching elements of environmental risk assessment

Held on 6-7 February 2014, Parma

(Agreed on 13 March 2014)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Michael Bonsall, Theo Brock, Robert Luttik, Ad Ragas, Claus Svendsen, Mira Kattwinkel, Jonathan Jeschke¹
- **Hearing Experts:**
 - none
- **European Commission, EU agencies and/or Member States representatives:**
 - none
- **EFSA:**
 - SCER Unit: Reinhilde Schoonjans
 - GMO Unit: Yann Devos
 - PPR Unit: Frans Streissl, José Tarazona
 - ALPLHA Unit: Sara Tramontini

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair, Robert Luttik, welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from the working group members on endangered species Paulo Sousa, as well as from the observers Jan Linders (SCHER); Emanuela Testai (SCENIHR); Ybele Hoogeveen, Dorota Jarosinksa (EEA); Romanas Cesnaites, Heike Schimmelpfennig, Angelo Maggiore (ECHA); Peter Kearns (OECD); Karin Nienstedt and Sarah Brown (DG SANCO); and from Jean-Marc Vidal (EMA).

¹ Online conference on 6 and 7 February

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests³, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest and the Specific Declaration of interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 4th Working Group meeting held on 28-29 01 2014, Parma.

The minutes were agreed without changes.

5. Scientific topics for discussion

5.1 Endangered Species ([EFSA-Q-2013-00901](#))

The working group addressed the main topics for the draft opinion during its scientific discussions on hazard assessment, exposure assessment and risk equation. An open exchange of views took place on the scientific approaches to cover endangered species in ERA schemes for regulated products/invasive species. Typically, there is a lack of data for both hazard and exposure estimations. The development of a first draft is foreseen for the next meeting. Further discussions are needed.

6. Any Other Business

6.1 Documentation

Working group members can share relevant background information through sciencenet.

7. Next meeting(s)

- 13 March (13.30 -17.30 CET) + 14 March (9.00-13.00 CET) 2014: RECOVERY - SC ERA WG meeting, Parma.
- 11 April: Teleconference steering group am, teleconference endangered species pm.
- 22 May (13.30 -17.30 CET) + 23 May (9.00-13.00 CET) 2014: ENDANGERED SPECIES - SC ERA WG meeting, Parma
- 5 June (13.30 -17.30 CET) + 6 June (9.00-13.00 CET) 2014: RECOVERY - SC ERA WG meeting, Parma.
- 11 July: Teleconference(s) for all
- August: none

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

- 11 (or 4?) September (13.30 -17.30 CET) + 12 (or 5?) September (9.00-13.00 CET) 2014: STEERING - SC ERA WG meeting, Parma (tbc)
- 9 October (13.30 -17.30 CET) + 10 October (9.00-13.00 CET) 2014: ENDANGERED SPECIES - SC ERA WG meeting, Parma
- 20 November (13.30 -17.30 CET) + 21 November (9.00-13.00 CET) 2014: RECOVERY - SC ERA WG meeting, Amsterdam
- 5 December: Teleconference(s) for all

Scientific Committee and Emerging Risks UNIT

Scientific Committee

Minutes of the 4th meeting of the Working Group on overarching elements of environmental risk assessment

Held on 28-29 January 2014, Parma

(Agreed on 6 February 2014)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**

- Franz Bigler, Michael Bonsall, Theo Brock, Geoff Frampton, Christer Hogstrand¹, Jonathan Jeschke, Mira Kattwinkel², Robert Luttik, Joe Perry, Ad Ragas, Jörg Romeis, Claus Svendsen, Chris Topping, and Wopke Van der Werf

- **Hearing Experts:**

- none

- **European Commission, EU agencies and/or Member States representatives:**

- Jan Linders (SCHER)
- Emanuela Testai (SCENIHR)
- Ybele Hoogeveen, Dorota Jarosinksa (EEA)³
- Romanas Cesnaites, Heike Schimmelpfennig, Angelo Maggiore (ECHA)^{2, 3}

- **EFSA:**

- SCER Unit: Reinhilde Schoonjans, Agnes Rortrais, Jean-Lou Dorne
- GMO Unit: Yann Devos
- PPR Unit: Frans Streissl, José Tarazona
- ALPLHA Unit: Sara Tramontini, Sybren Vos, Frank Berthe

¹ Present on 29 January

² In teleconference on 28 January am

³ In teleconference on 28 January pm

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair, Robert Luttik, welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from the working group members Tony Hardy and Paulo Sousa, as well as from the observers Peter Kearns (OECD), Karin Nienstedt and Sarah Brown (DG SANCO), and from Jean-Marc Vidal (EMA).

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted after adding a presentation on the FEEDAP approach in item 5.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes⁴ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests⁵, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest and the Specific Declaration of interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 3rd Working Group meeting held on 28-29 11 2013, Parma.

The minutes were agreed without changes.

5. Scientific topics for discussion

5.1 Protection Goals ([EFSA-Q-2013-00289](#))

The WG discussed further the elements and steps underlying the operationalisation of protection goals as mentioned in broad terms in the sectorial legislation governing the work of the respective EFSA panels. As the types of regulated products/species subject to risk assessment are substantially different, so are the respective legal sectorial legislations and the requirements for ERA. Similarities and differences in the current ERA schemes of the involved EFSA panels were already identified during the previous meeting and required further detailed mapping. The Panels have in general considered both structural and functional elements of biodiversity in their risk assessment schemes. During presentations given by the PLH Panel, the GMO Panel, the PPR Panel and the FEEDAP Panel representatives, the underlying rationales and details of similarities/differences were clarified. On the basis of the information presented and other documents referred to as a source of definitions, the working group shall carefully evaluate where harmonisation would be useful, and where not. One common glossary was acknowledged as a useful target.

5.2 Endangered Species ([EFSA-Q-2013-00901](#))

Some issues regarding the coverage of endangered species in current ERA schemes were discussed in the context of the above topic on protection goals. The development of the draft outline opinion is scheduled for the next meeting.

⁴ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

⁵ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

5.3 Recovery ([EFSA-Q-2013-00902](#))

Some issues regarding the concept of ecological recovery for ERA were discussed in the context of the above topic on protection goals. The development of the draft outline opinion is scheduled for the forthcoming meeting in March.

6. Any Other Business

6.1 Documentation

Working group members can share relevant background information through sciencenet.

7. Next meeting(s)

- 28 January (9.00 -17.30 CET) + 29 January (9.00-13.00 CET) 2014: FULL SC ERA WG meeting, Parma.
- 6 February (13.30 -17.30 CET) + 7 February (9.00-13.00 CET) 2014: ENDANGERED SPECIES - SC ERA WG meeting, Parma.
- 13 March (13.30 -17.30 CET) + 14 March (9.00-13.00 CET) 2014: RECOVERY - SC ERA WG meeting, Parma.
- 11 April (tbc): Teleconference(s) for all
- 22 May (13.30 -17.30 CET) + 23 May (9.00-13.00 CET) 2014: ENDANGERED SPECIES - SC ERA WG meeting, Parma
- 5 June (13.30 -17.30 CET) + 6 June (9.00-13.00 CET) 2014: RECOVERY - SC ERA WG meeting, Parma.
- 11 July: Teleconference(s) for all
- August: none
- 11 September (13.30 -17.30 CET) + 12 September (9.00-13.00 CET) 2014: STEERING - SC ERA WG meeting, Parma (tbc)
- 9 October (13.30 -17.30 CET) + 10 October (9.00-13.00 CET) 2014: ENDANGERED SPECIES - SC ERA WG meeting, Parma
- 20 November (13.30 -17.30 CET) + 21 November (9.00-13.00 CET) 2014: RECOVERY - SC ERA WG meeting, Amsterdam
- 5 December: Teleconference(s) for all

Scientific Committee and Emerging Risks UNIT

Scientific Committee

Minutes of the 3rd meeting of the Working Group on overarching elements of environmental risk assessment

Held on 28-29 November 2013, Parma

(Agreed on 28 January 2014)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Michael Bonsall, Theo Brock, Geoff Frampton, Tony Hardy, Christer Hogstrand¹, Jonathan Jeschke, Mira Kattwinkel, Robert Luttik, Joe Perry, Jörg Romeis, Chris Topping, and Wopke Van der Werf
- **Hearing Experts:**
 - none
- **European Commission, EU agencies and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Jan Linders (SCHER)
 - Emanuela Testai (SCENIHR)
 - Peter Kearns (OECD)
- **EFSA:**
 - SCER Unit: Reinhilde Schoonjans, Andrea Germini, Agnes Rortrais, Jean-Lou Dorne
 - GMO Unit: Yann Devos
 - PPR Unit: Stephanie Bopp
 - PLH Unit: Sara Tramontini

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair, Robert Luttik, welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from the working group member Paulo Sousa, as well as from the observers Ybele Hoogeveen and Dorota Jarosinksa (EEA); Romanas Cesnaites, Heike

¹ Present on 29 November

Schimmelpfennig and Angelo Maggiore (ECHA); Karin Nienstedt and Sarah Brown (DG SANCO), Jean-Marc Vidal (EMA)¹.

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests³, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest and the Specific Declaration of interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 2nd Working Group meeting held on 09 09 2013, Parma.

The minutes were agreed without changes.

5. Scientific topics for discussion

5.1 Protection Goals ([EFSA-Q-2013-00289](#))

The 19th Scientific Colloquium on "*Biodiversity as protection goal in environmental risk Assessment for EU agro-ecosystems*" took place on 27-28 November 2013. Nearly 100 scientific experts from various stakeholder groups participated and exchanged ideas on protection goals in ERA for agro-ecosystems, specifically on measuring biodiversity, on covering endangered species and on the ecological recovery concept. The discussions at the Colloquium, represent an important source of information for the working group aiming at harmonisation of making protection goals operational in ERA. The WG discussed further the elements and steps underlying the operationalisation of protection goals as mentioned in broad terms in the law. Similarities and differences are identifiable in the current ERA schemes in EFSA and careful evaluation is required of where harmonisation would be useful, and where not. This process will benefit from further illustrations and details to be presented at the next working group meeting. One common glossary was acknowledged as essential.

5.2 Endangered Species ([EFSA-Q-2013-00901](#))

Key issues regarding the coverage of endangered species in current ERA schemes were discussed in the context of developing the opinion under the ERA mandate and the above question number. A first outline was proposed to address the specific questions of the terms of reference.

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

5.3 Recovery ([EFSA-Q-2013-00902](#))

Key issues regarding the concept of ecological recovery for ERA were discussed in the context of developing the opinion under the ERA mandate and the above question number. A first outline was proposed to address the specific questions of the terms of reference.

6. Any Other Business

6.1 Documentation

Working group members can share relevant background information through sciencenet.

7. Next meeting(s)

- 28 January (9.00 -17.30 CET) + 29 January (9.00-13.00 CET) 2014: FULL SC ERA WG meeting, Parma.
- 6 February (13.30 -17.30 CET) + 7 February (9.00-13.00 CET) 2014: ENDANGERED SPECIES - SC ERA WG meeting, Parma.
- 13 March (13.30 -17.30 CET) + 14 March (9.00-13.00 CET) 2014: RECOVERY - SC ERA WG meeting, Parma.
- 11 April (tbc): Teleconference(s) for all
- 22 May (13.30 -17.30 CET) + 23 May (9.00-13.00 CET) 2014: ENDANGERED SPECIES - SC ERA WG meeting, Parma
- 5 June (13.30 -17.30 CET) + 6 June (9.00-13.00 CET) 2014: RECOVERY - SC ERA WG meeting, Parma.
- 11 July: Teleconference(s) for all
- August: none
- 11 September (13.30 -17.30 CET) + 12 September (9.00-13.00 CET) 2014: STEERING - SC ERA WG meeting, Parma (tbc)
- 9 October (13.30 -17.30 CET) + 10 October (9.00-13.00 CET) 2014: ENDANGERED SPECIES - SC ERA WG meeting, Parma
- 20 November (13.30 -17.30 CET) + 21 November (9.00-13.00 CET) 2014: RECOVERY - SC ERA WG meeting, Amsterdam
- 5 December: Teleconference(s) for all

Scientific Committee and Emerging Risks UNIT

Scientific Committee

Minutes of the 2nd meeting of the Working Group on overarching elements of environmental risk assessment

Held on 20 September 2013, Parma

(Agreed on 28 November 2013)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Theo Brock, Christer Hogstrand, Robert Luttik, Jörg Romeis, Tony Hardy¹, Joe Perry and Wopke Van der Werf
- **Hearing Experts:**
 - none
- **European Commission, EU agencies and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Sarah Brown (DG SANCO)¹
 - Jean-Marc Vidal (EMA)¹
 - Romanas Cesnaites (ECHA)¹
- **EFSA:**
 - SCER Unit: Reinhilde Schoonjans
 - GMO Unit: Yann Devos
 - PPR Unit: Stephanie Bopp
 - PLH Unit: Sara Tramontini

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair, Robert Luttik, welcomed the participants.

Apologies were received from the working group members and as well as from the observers Ybele Hoogeveen and Dorota Jarosinksa (EEA); Peter Kearns (OECD); Heike Schimmelpennig and Angelo Maggiore (ECHA); Karin Nienstedt (DG SANCO).

¹ participated via tele/web conference

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes² and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests³, EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of interest and the Specific Declaration of interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Agreement of the minutes of the 1st Working Group meeting held on 09 07 2013, Parma.

The minutes were agreed after editorial changes, bringing them in line with the briefing notes for the colloquium.

5. Scientific topics for discussion

5.1 Protection Goals ([EFSA-Q-2013-00289](#))

The 19th Scientific Colloquium on "*Biodiversity as protection goal in environmental risk Assessment for EU agro-ecosystems*" will take place on 27-28 November 2013. Risk managers working with protection goals as set in the sectorial legislations for plant protection products, GMO and plant health are invited, as well as external scientific experts. Free online registration will be possible during October. The programme and the briefing notes of the colloquium were reviewed in detail by the WG. Outstanding discussions were resolved during the meeting and all suggestions were incorporated directly in the document version 4. These briefing notes will be prepared for further discussion by the Organising Committee of the colloquium.

The WG discussed briefly the further steps to compare current ERA schemes in EFSA. Input from the PLH Panel is envisaged through EFSA staff.

5.2 Endangered Species

Key issues regarding the coverage of endangered species in current ERA schemes were discussed in the context of the briefing notes for the colloquium. Ideas and comments were captured directly in the document version 4.

5.3 Recovery

The principle of the recovery option in environmental risk management and the implications for risk assessment were discussed in the context of the briefing notes for the colloquium. Ideas and comments were captured directly in the document version 4.

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

³ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

6. Any Other Business

6.1 Feedback from other agencies:

Jan Linders from SCHER and Emanuala Testai from SCENIHR were appointed as observers to the WG. Guy Van den Eede is the contact point in JRC.

6.2 Communicating the work of the WG

Reinhilde Schoonjans presented the WG and its mandate to the EFSA PPR Panel at the plenary meeting of 19 September 2013. Several issues were raised e.g. the use of omic techniques to take account of the genetic backgrounds of species; the assumption of recolonisation in the context of recovery and relating to the scale of modern agricultural landscapes; the fragmentation of the EU landscapes and the input for sustainable agriculture under Horizon 2020; and the need also to comply with human protection goals.

7. Next meeting(s)

- 27-28 November 2013: Scientific Colloquium on Protection Goals, Parma
- 28-29 November 2013: 3rd WG meeting covering the specific topics of endangered species and recovery.
- 28 January (13.30 -17.30 CET) + 29 January (9.00-13.00 CET) 2014: SC ERA WG meeting, Parma (tbc)
- 11 September (13.30 -17.30 CET) + 12 September (9.00-13.00 CET) 2014: SC ERA WG meeting, Parma (tbc)

Scientific Committee and Emerging Risks UNIT

Scientific Committee

Minutes of the 1st meeting of the Working Group on overarching elements of environmental risk assessment

Held on 09 July 2013, Parma

(Agreed on 20 September 2013)

Participants

- **Working Group Experts:**
 - Theo Brock, Christer Hogstrand, Robert Luttik, Jörg Romeis
 - Joe Perry has participated via teleconference in agenda point 5
- **Hearing Experts:**
 - none
- **European Commission, EU agencies and/or Member States representatives:**
 - Jean-Marc Vidal (EMA), Dorota Jarosinksa (EEA)
 - Heike Schimmelpfennig and Angelo Maggiore (ECHA), Karin Nienstedt (DG SANCO) have participated via teleconference in agenda point 5.
- **EFSA:**
 - SCOM Unit: Reinhilde Schoonjans
 - EMRISK Unit: Jean-Lou Dorne participated for agenda item 4 and 5
 - GMO Unit: Yann Devos
 - PPR Unit: Stephanie Bopp
 - PLH Unit: Sara Tramontini

1. Welcome and apologies for absence

The Chair, Robert Luttik, welcomed the participants who introduced themselves during a tour de table.

Apologies were received from the working group members Tony Hardy and Wopke Van der Werf as well as from the observers José Tarazona and Romanas Cesnaites from ECHA.

Page 1 of 4

2. Adoption of agenda

The agenda was adopted without changes.

3. Declarations of interest

In accordance with EFSA's Policy on Independence and Scientific Decision-Making Processes¹ and the Decision of the Executive Director implementing this Policy regarding Declarations of Interests², EFSA screened the Annual Declaration of Interest and the Specific Declaration of interest filled in by the experts invited for the present meeting. No conflicts of interests related to the issues discussed in this meeting have been identified during the screening process or at the Oral Declaration of Interest at the beginning of this meeting.

4. Background information

Tasks and deliverables of the WG:

As specified in the mandate, the Working Group shall provide separate draft opinions on harmonising the approach to setting protection goals and the two specific elements of environmental risk assessment (ERA) within the remit of EFSA, i.e. Coverage of endangered non-target species and Recovery of non-target species. The approved mandate as well as the letter of acceptance is available in the EFSA public register of questions [EFSA-Q-2013-00289](#) and on sciencenet. The draft opinions should be presented to the EFSA Scientific Committee for possible adoption by June 2015.

Composition of the WG:

As specified in the mandate, Experts from the relevant EFSA Panels (GMO, PPR, PLH and FEEDAP) are included in the working group. An additional expert member was selected on the basis of his complementary expertise for ecology of a wide range of non-target arthropods.

In accordance to the mandate, the working group will involve during the preparation of the opinions the experience and guidance developed by other EU agencies and scientific bodies through the presence of the observers from the European Environmental Agency (EEA), European Chemicals Agency (ECHA), European Medicines Agency (EMA) and OECD. Nominations are awaited from JRC and the DG SANCO non-food committees, especially the Scientific Committee for Environmental Health Risks. The US Environmental Protection Agency has nominated an expert for the colloquium. WHO/IPCS did not yet respond.

Agreed work division:

The overarching SC ERA WG will ensure consistency throughout the mandate and will ensure that all activities are developed in a way that is compatible for all the relevant EFSA panels. This overarching WG is advising on the topics of the colloquium on protection goals (see item 5.1). In addition topical meetings will be organised for endangered species and for recovery. The overarching WG will meet 2-3 times per year and topical meetings might be organised up to 4 times a year.

¹ <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencepolicy.pdf>

² <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/keydocs/docs/independencerules.pdf>

5. Scientific topic(s) to be addressed in the opinions

During an upfront survey amongst the WG members, there seems not to be prior work done in this area by other scientific risk assessment bodies at European level. Aspects and required expertise of relevance, for inclusion in the work were discussed.

5.1 Protection Goals ([EFSA-Q-2013-00289](#))

After the introduction by Robert Luttik, discussions took place in the context of organising a Scientific Colloquium on the topic of protection goals on 27-28 November in Parma. The same themes will be addressed as during the EFSA 2010 workshop³ on PPP. Now, the aim is to have more wide discussions regardless of the type of stressor.

5.2 Endangered species ([EFSA-Q-2013-00289](#))

The context and current state of the art were presented by Robert Luttik during a short introduction of this specific topic. The WG members shared general views and initiated discussions on the more specific questions under the mandate:

- *“Are endangered species more vulnerable than other species:
 - based on their toxicological sensitivity, exposure, specific potential for recovery, low genetic diversity, or
 - because of other stressors e.g. limited, marginal or fragmented habitat?*
- *Do the current ERA schemes appropriately cover endangered species?*
- *If not, what risk mitigation measures can be envisaged to prevent endangered species being put at risk from stressors resulting from the application of a regulated product?*
- *Is monitoring needed to check the efficacy of risk mitigation measures for the occurrence of endangered species?”*

The WG will focus on developing a method for assessing the risk to endangered species. The context of this work is the risk assessment of regulated products to be used in agro-ecosystems. The question if endangered species can/should be protected in agricultural fields is a broader question extending beyond the remit of this WG.

5.3 Recovery ([EFSA-Q-2013-00289](#))

Also for this topic, the context and current state of the art were presented by Robert Luttik during a short introduction. The WG members shared again their general views and experience. Discussions were initiated on particular aspects of relevance, in order to prepare for answering the specific questions of the mandate:

³ Report on the PPR Stakeholder Workshop Protection goals for environmental risk assessment of pesticide: What and where to protect: <http://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/search/doc/1672.pdf>

- *“Which are the relevant traits of different organism groups and what are their respective quantifiable and/or non quantifiable parameters that characterise recovery, e.g.*
 - *genetic diversity, needed for populations to adapt to new selective pressures of the environment,*
 - *potential for internal recovery by the exposed population, determined by life-cycle and reproduction characteristics,*
 - *potential for external recovery (immigration) from unexposed populations, determined by dispersion ability and mobility.*
- *How to take into account the potential of recovery in ERA under real field conditions assuming repeated exposure? The above traits of different organism groups relevant for recovery could be used for comparison to e.g. the pesticide application patterns or other exposure patterns relevant for other units of EFSA.*
- *How to describe the parameters relevant for the recovery of different organism groups in a generic way i.e. which would allow their use in other (or all) relevant areas within EFSA’s remit.”*

6. Any Other Business

6.1 Scienenet

WG members confirmed successful use of scienenet as document exchange platform.

6.2 Special remarks

The ongoing work of the PPR WG on good modelling practice might inform this mandate.

7. Next meeting(s)

- 20 September 2013: 2nd SC ERA WG meeting, Parma
- 27-28 November 2013: Scientific colloquium on Protection Goals, Parma
- 29 November 2013: 1st meeting of the specific WG on endangered species and 1st meeting of the specific WG on recovery.
- 28 January (13.30 -17.30 CET) + 29 January (9.00-13.00 CET) 2014: 3rd SC ERA WG meeting, Parma (tbc)
- 11 September (13.30 -17.30 CET) + 12 September (9.00-13.00 CET) 2014: 4th SC ERA WG meeting, Parma (tbc)